

Pakistan's Post-Election Politics and the Formation of the Second Minority Sharif Government: Analysis of the Politics and Challenges

By Dr. Sohail Mahmood.

Today, amid rigging allegations arising out of the elections, Pakistan finds itself in a political crisis yet again. On March 3, 2024, Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PMLN) president Shehbaz Sharif, was elected prime minister of Pakistan after securing a majority vote from lawmakers in the National Assembly. Shehbaz secured 201 votes while Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) candidate Omar secured 92. Shehbaz's victory was expected as he enjoyed the support of seven other parties apart from the PMLN. It has the support of the Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP), Muttahida Qaumi Movement-Pakistan (MQM-P), Pakistan Muslim League-Quaid (PML-Q), Balochistan Awami Party (BAP), Pakistan Muslim League-Zia (PML-Z), Istehkam-e-Pakistan Party (IPP) and National Party (NP).

The PMLN president Shehbaz is the younger brother of former three-time prime minister Nawaz Sharif, 74, who sprang a surprise last month after being projected as the party's prime ministerial candidate ahead of the February 8 elections, marred by alleged vote rigging.

Nawaz Sharif, who returned to Pakistan from London in October 2023 to become Pakistan's prime minister for a record fourth time, decided against contesting as his PMLN party failed to garner enough seats in the February 8 elections to form a government on its own. Shehbaz served as prime minister of a coalition government from April 2022 to August 2023 before Parliament was dissolved to hold general elections.¹ Meanwhile, PTI founder Imran Khan is incarcerated in prison.

The PTI then decided to hold a protest on March 2 against the alleged rigging in the elections held on February 8. The PTI Secretary General Omar Ayub spoke about the "large scale" rigging in the elections.

Ayub said PTI will hold nationwide protests against "rigging" elections alongside other political parties. He said, "Our seats were stolen with just a stroke of the pen. The people gave the mandate to the former PTI chair. The nation's mandate and our seats have been attacked. Omar Ayub said that PTI will hold protests in courts and assemblies. He further said, "Ours is the fight of truth." Imran Khan instructed the party to hold nationwide protests on March 2.

Meanwhile, PMLN and Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP), which are the second and third largest parties in the elections in terms of numbers, have decided to form the government in the Centre, Punjab, and Balochistan.² Meanwhile, the PTI has alleged rigging in the polls. Later, on March 2, 2024, staged protest demonstrations against "rigging" in the February 8 general elections, across all the major cities amid clashes with the police. Despite having the biggest number of successful candidates in the polls, the Imran Khan-founded party had given a nationwide protest call against the "stolen" mandate.

During one of the demonstrations, the police baton charged and arrested PTI workers. The party had decided to conduct protests amid heavy police deployment in Islamabad, Lahore Rawalpindi, Gujrat, and Karachi. The PTI claimed that their "peaceful protests" were interrupted by state machinery and law enforcement officials. "The people have taken to the streets to take back their stolen mandate," he added. The party said that "unconstitutional" obstacles in the way of protests show fear and cowardice,

adding that they will not accept the “rigged” elections through Form 47. The PTI said that it will continue its struggle to claim its stolen mandate back.³

A day after it launched a fierce crackdown, Lahore police took legal action on March 11, 2024, by registering a case against 38 Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) workers and leaders for alleged arson and vandalism in Lahore.

The police have been accused of launching a forceful response against PTI supporters and arresting over 100 members during nationwide protests, triggered by alleged rigging in February general election.

The PTI had organized protests to demand the restoration of what it claims to be its "stolen mandate" from the February 8 election, as well as the immediate release of party leaders, including founder and former premier Imran Khan.

The Lahore demonstration, initially intended to voice these demands, turned violent as PTI members and supporters clashed with the police. Numerous videos circulating on social media depicted scenes of police officers wielding sticks and forcibly detaining protesters inside police vehicles.⁴ As expected, on March 8, 2024, Asif Ali Zardari, with the backing of the coalition parties was elected as the country's 14th president defeating Mahmood Khan Achakzai of the Sunni Ittehad Council. On March 10, Zardari, co-chairman of the Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP), took oath as President of Pakistan for a second term. Previously, PM Shehbaz led a coalition government following the ouster of the PTI-led federal government, while Zardari completed his first five-year term as President of Pakistan in 2013. Seemingly with the old guard back in power, the country was poised for stability.

On March 11, 2024, a 19-member federal cabinet was sworn in by President Asif Ali Zardari. Earlier, during his 16-month tenure as the PM between April 2022 and August 2023, Shehbaz had an excessively large federal cabinet, drawing widespread criticism with some describing it as a financial burden on taxpayers amidst economic challenges. Today, Pakistan faces daunting economic challenges. Today, Pakistan is drowning in debt.

Pakistan has momentous external financing requirements for the next fiscal year, but its quota in the IMF limits the size of the financing to around \$6 billion. The exact financing requirements and the IMF loan size will be determined during the review talks.

In the first week of March 2024, the IMF said:⁵

The fund aims to support the implementation of strong policies to deepen financial stability, address long-standing economic and underlying balance of payments challenges, and restore sustained and inclusive growth for the benefit of all Pakistani citizens... to achieve these objectives there is a need for Pakistan to ensure stronger public finances, through high-quality revenue measures to broaden the tax base while scaling up the support for the most vulnerable.

Pakistan urgently needs a fresh IMF agreement to shore up an economy suffering from high inflation, low reserves, and high external financing needs.

Pakistan's current \$3 billion, nine-month IMF bailout program expires next month, and the country's economic team must negotiate a longer-term program immediately afterward.

Steering Pakistan out of its latest economic crisis will, however, present a different challenge, as will bringing stability to a country plagued by crippling boom-bust cycles that has seen it enter more than 20 IMF programs in the 76 years since it won independence.

The Shariff government will need to strike a difficult balance between tough reforms and rejuvenating a struggling economy.

Pakistan also needs to attract foreign investment to bring in funds to shore up its low reserves, which are critical to meeting large external financing needs, as well as kick-starting its flagging economy, which shrunk -0.2% last year.

Meanwhile, the Sharif government also has to work with the powerful military, which has increased its role in recent years in the country's financial decision-making and has a formal role in policy through a powerful economic body of which the army chief is a member.

Efforts to assuage growing public anger at record inflation hovering around 30% will also be challenging with limited fiscal space.⁶

Pakistan's debt-to-GDP ratio is already above 70% and the IMF and credit rating agencies estimate that the interest payments on its debt will soak up 50% to 60% of the government's revenues this year. That is the worst ratio of any sizable economy in the world.⁷

The total external and domestic debt in June 2023 was Rs 60.4 trillion, which increased to Rs 64.8 trillion in January 2024. The failure of the caretakers to contain the budgeted current expenditure was indicated by the 43 percent rise in fiscal deficit in the first half of the current year compared to the same period the year before as noted in the Finance Division's February Economic Update and Outlook.⁸

Undoubtedly, Pakistan's taxation structure requires urgent reforms - from the current heavy reliance on indirect taxes (to the tune of over 75 percent) whose incidence on the poor is greater than on the rich to direct taxes based on the ability to pay principle which would necessitate widening the tax net and removing all exemptions currently enjoyed by the wealthy (inclusive of raising provincial farm tax on the rich landlords, the builders, the traders, the aartis). The Caretakers consolidated reforms, though they were restrained from their implementation by the Election Commission of Pakistan, which were largely identified during the tenure of previous administrations but never implemented for political reasons. However, they did succeed in making inroads into taking punitive measures against those who did not file their returns or evaded taxes but what is relevant to note is that these reform proposals consisted mainly of administrative measures. Hopefully, the second Sharif government will tackle this problem proactively, which would have beneficial political implications if these tax reforms shifted the burden away from the relatively poorer sections of society towards the rich and influential. So far no government, civilian or military, elected or caretaker, has taken bold measures to deal with the economic impasse that has deepened over decades of flawed policies, which explains why the budget deficit is high, the current account deficit periodically requires the country to go on yet another Fund program and the rest of the world is increasingly wary of extending loans without a strictly monitored Fund program.

Earlier, the 12th general elections held on February 8, 2024, were massively rigged by the military, and delivered a hung parliament. There was a shutdown of cellular and internet services. The PTI dominated the election results, with the highest number of successful candidates in the general elections.

The National Assembly, the lower house of Pakistan's bicameral parliament has 266 general seats, with another 70 reserved for women and minorities. A party or coalition needs 169 seats to form a government. About 60.6 million Pakistanis came out to vote in the elections and it recorded a low turnout with only 47.9pc of total eligible voters exercising their right to vote.

Out of the 266 directly elected seats in Parliament the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) party's affiliated independent candidates won 93 seats. Former Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif's Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PMLN) won 75 seats; the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) came third with 54 seats. The Muttahida Qaumi Movement Pakistan (MQMP) came fourth with 17 seats, JUI-F won four seats, PML-Q secured victory in three constituencies, while IPP and Balochistan National Party (BNP) won two seats each. The Majlis Wahdat ul Muslimeen (MWM), National Party (NP), PML-Z, Balochistan Awami Party (BAP), Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PKMAP), and Pakhtunkhwa National Awami Party (PNAP) have won one seat each.⁹ The VOA reported on February 15, 2024, that the vote was for change and that it was:¹⁰

primarily aimed toward the military establishment, which has a history of manipulating Pakistan's political landscape. Both Sharif and Khan have accused the top brass of forcing them out of office...As results came in after a delay of nearly 15 hours amid widespread allegations of rigging, Pakistan's Army Chief General Asim Munir issued a statement calling on all to "move on from the politics of anarchy and polarization.

The PTI quickly alleged that it was deprived of a far greater mandate by widespread rigging and the manipulation of results, with its current leader Gohar Ali Khan suggesting they have evidence showing that the PTI won at least 180 seats out of 266 that were voted for. Protests continue across Pakistan, with PTI and several other parties claiming their mandates were stolen. Pakistan's interim government has rejected international calls to investigate allegations of rigging, saying the electoral process was a sovereign internal affair.¹¹

In its report, the Free and Fair Election Network, or FAFEN, an Islamabad observer group, said:¹² "Many election officials failed to follow rules or make necessary arrangements to gather results promptly. More than a dozen people have died in postelection violence."

The newly elected parliament will be sworn in in the next two weeks. The house will then elect its leader, who will serve as the prime minister. With Khan so far refusing to build an alliance with Zardari's PPP, the latter has agreed to throw his weight behind a coalition government led by PMLN. Analysts say that a minority government with no legitimacy will not survive for an exceptionally long time, despite the backing of the establishment.¹³

Pakistan's Army Chief General Asim Munir issued a statement calling on all to "move on from the politics of anarchy and polarization."¹⁴ The outcome of the election was surprising because, over the past months, the PTI has been almost decapitated by the military. It was effectively banned from contesting the general election after its cricket bat symbol, used on ballots to identify candidates, was removed and party members' speeches were barred from airing on television. PTI members instead stood as independent candidates.

Imran Khan was brought to power in 2018 with the blessing of the military. He was removed from power when he fell out with the military and went on to wage a risky campaign of defiance against it.

Khan has been behind bars since August 2023 and has been slapped with lengthy sentences for corruption, treason, and illegal marriage. Khan was ousted as prime minister in a parliamentary vote of no confidence, after which several criminal charges were laid against him. He was jailed on various charges a week before the election. Khan has said the legal cases against him were fabricated and part of a wider political witch-hunt.¹⁵ These charges were designed to keep him from power. In these elections, Khan's candidates were forced to run as independents. However, surprisingly candidates backed by his PTI emerged as the single largest bloc in the election result.

Earlier, the Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN) released a review report on voter turnout for the February 2024 Pakistani elections, revealing a decrease compared to 2018. However, the report also highlights a positive trend: a narrowing gender gap in voters.

According to FAFEN's analysis of Form 47 data from 264 National Assembly constituencies, approximately 47.6% of registered voters cast their ballots in 2024, compared to 52.1% in 2018. This represents a decrease of about 4.5%.

While the highest turnout was seen in Tharparkar (70.9%), South Waziristan registered the lowest at 16.3%. Interestingly, Islamabad, which had a turnout of 58.3% in 2018, saw a significant dip to 54.2% this year.¹⁶

The report also highlights the increase in registered voters, from 100.6 million in 2018 to 120.86 million in 2024. However, despite this growth, the overall voting percentage dropped.

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa experienced the biggest drop in turnout, falling from 44% to 39.5%. Punjab and Sindh also saw declines, dropping from 56.8% to 51.6% and 47.2% to 43.7%, respectively. Balochistan's turnout remained stable, going from 45.3% to 42.9%.¹⁷

Despite the overall decrease in turnout, the report paints a positive picture of women's participation. FAFEN commends the significant improvement in female voter engagement, with no constituency recording less than 10% turnout from women in 2024. This represents a significant increase compared to 2018.

However, the report also acknowledges the persistent gender gap. While the turnout of male voters was 55.6% in the analyzed constituencies, it was only 45.6% for women. This highlights the need for further efforts to encourage women's political participation.¹⁸

There had occurred a shutdown of cellular and internet services on election day and after. As expected, there was widespread criticism for the alleged rigging and manipulation of the election results by the military. Pakistan finds itself in crisis again. Despite lacking the numbers to form a government, Imran Khan declared victory from prison, and his supporters took to the streets and went to court to protest. The PTI made claims of wide-scale poll rigging.¹⁹

It has been many alleged that Pakistan's all-powerful military army has rigged the elections against Imran Khan. In several constituencies, the official vote tally differs wildly from the total arrived at by adding up numbers from individual polling stations. Both the US and the European Union have called for an investigation into allegations of interference in the electoral process. Pakistan's caretaker prime minister called the elections "free and fair."²⁰

In the elections, the independent candidates backed by PTI surged to early leads. However, the results announced were visibly worse for PTI. Many allege that Pakistan's army rigged things against Imran Khan. In several constituencies, the official vote total is quite different from the total arrived at by tallying numbers from each polling station. Both the US and the European Union called for an investigation into allegations of interference in the elections. However, Pakistan's caretaker prime minister called the elections free and fair.²¹

There was now political tension in the country as the PTI was staging nationwide protests about the alleged rigging. Resultantly, the country descended into political uncertainty. Pakistan's sovereign dollar bonds fell as much as 1.2 cents with the 2024 bond standing at 95.89 cents in the aftermath of the contentious election.²² It was feared that political uncertainty could exacerbate economic instability.²³

Earlier, Nawaz Sharif's party staked a claim to lead a coalition government.²⁴

On February 13, 2024, led by the PMLN and PPP announced the formation of a coalition government that will have more than 150 members in the parliament.²⁵ The contentious parliamentary election is now mired in controversy.²⁶

Pakistan's media regulators have blocked the social media platform X, formerly Twitter, with users across the country on February 22, 2024, enduring the sixth day of sweeping disruptions, and partial and complete shutdowns. Human rights activists have demanded a full restoration of internet services and access to social media. Washington has also urged Pakistan to lift restrictions on X.²⁷

The outage was first observed over the weekend when the political party of Pakistan's imprisoned former Prime Minister Imran Khan announced protests against what it says were rigged Feb. 8 parliamentary elections.

In the vote, candidates backed by Khan, who was barred from running, won most seats but were short of a simple majority needed to form a government. Social media platforms are often used by protest organizers to call followers out to the streets and spread the word about planned demonstrations.²⁸

Pakistan has witnessed an increase in political instability since the balloting. The country's elections oversight body denies charges by Khan's party that the vote was stolen. The PTI said on February 22, 2024, that the restrictions on X have been placed by the authorities to suppress its voice on social media.²⁹

Earlier, on February 21, 2024, US State Department spokesperson Matthew Miller expressed concerns in a statement to reporters over the outage and restrictions on the freedom of expression and association in Pakistan.

"We continue to call on Pakistan to respect freedom of expression and restore access to a social media that has been restricted including Twitter, now known as X," Miller said. "We have and will continue to emphasize the importance of respecting these fundamental freedoms during our engagements with Pakistani officials."³⁰

Digital rights activists said the platform was used to protest the alleged rigging of the results.³¹

Media watchdog Freedom Network called the undeclared ban on social networking platform X, which has been down in Pakistan since February 17 for unknown reasons, direct state-led censorship to deny citizens the right to express themselves.

The ban on X comes days after another ban was imposed on mobile phones and mobile internet on election day which was shocking and disallowed voters from using technology to easily move to polling stations.³²

The Economist article “Confusion reigns in Pakistan’s rigged election” it was said that:³³

Despite their strenuous efforts, the generals appear much less in control than they thought. Until very recently Nawaz Sharif seemed certain to be Pakistan’s next prime minister. On February 6th, his Pakistan Muslim League (PML-N) party took out full-page adverts in major Pakistani newspapers announcing its imminent victory in elections on February 8th and anointing Mr. Sharif the head of its new government. Assured of the support of the country’s powerful army, which has in effect been running the country through a loyal caretaker government since Parliament was dissolved in August, Mr. Sharif, a three-time former prime minister, and his party appeared set to romp home. That confidence is starting to look premature. Mr. Sharif’s path had been cleared by the imprisonment of the country’s most popular politician, the former prime minister Imran Khan, and the de facto outlawing of his Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) party. Yet early results suggest that PTI candidates, running as independents, have nonetheless done much better than expected. More than 24 hours after polls closed, results had been announced for 148 of the country’s 265 directly elected parliamentary seats. These give independent candidates 61 seats to the PML-N’s 43.

The Economist article entitled “Pakistan is out of friends and out of money” published on February 14, 2024, maintained that:³⁴

A botched election and an economic crisis show how low it has fallen. Pakistan’s election on February 8th featured state-of-the-art avatars and TikTok videos, but the question it poses evokes an old theme. How long can the country’s relentless decline continue before it triggers a revolution, outside intervention, or—hope against hope—political renewal? For decades, the generals have ruled nuclear-armed Pakistan directly or via a stage-managed democracy featuring a recurring cast of corrupt dynastic parties (and the occasional political disrupter). The main political clans agreed to back a new government on February 13th. Unfortunately, after a rigged vote, it begins plagued by illegitimacy and a mounting financial crisis.

Hannah Ellis-Petersen and Shah Meer Baloch in an article in the Guardian Weekly published on February 15, 2024, entitled “Pakistan’s generals’ elections: inside the 16 February Guardian Weekly, Pakistan” stated that:³⁵

When Pakistan holds an election, there’s an established pattern to how things generally play out. The military selects a preferred candidate (in this case Nawaz Sharif), and then discredits/exiles/imprisons the main challenger (in this case, Imran Khan). The vote is held, and the military’s preferred candidate wins. It is no wonder they are known inside the country as “the generals’ elections.” This time, things did not go quite according to plan. Despite Khan having been safely locked up, his Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) party came out on top – though not with an overall majority, sparking allegations of serious vote-rigging from PTI supporters..... The military had tried and failed to stifle the PTI and its voters into

submission before last week's vote. How will this all play out? it was confirmed that Nawaz Sharif's PML-N party would after all form the government, in a complex coalition with the Pakistan People's Party (PPP). Shehbaz Sharif, Nawaz's younger brother who is known to be close to the military, is likely to be prime minister, with the PPP co-chair Asif Ali Zardari as president. So, did the generals get their way after all? Maybe not. A marriage of convenience between two weak political parties, in defiance of the popular vote, merely illustrates the shaky state of Pakistan's democracy and seems unlikely to last for long. Mr. Khan's against-all-odds victory burnishes his status as a larger-than-life figure in Pakistan. The army and its allies threw everything they had at him. They barred Mr. Khan from running for Parliament, jailed scores of PTI leaders in addition to Mr. Khan, twisted the arms of others to leave the party, and disallowed the PTI from using its well-known electoral symbol, the cricket bat. All this appears only to have strengthened Mr. Khan. In theory, army chief Gen. Asim Munir could step down and make way for a successor more amenable to the PTI leader's return to power. But this would be such a massive capitulation from the military that it could throw the state into chaos. As long as Mr. Munir and his top generals remain opposed to Mr. Khan, his odds of getting out of prison—where he is serving at least 14 years on charges ranging from corruption to an “un-Islamic marriage” to his third wife—remain slim. The former prime minister denies any wrongdoing. Things would not look much sunnier even if Mr. Khan somehow clawed his way back to power. His brand of Islamic populism—railing against America and promising to turn Pakistan into a welfare state modeled on Medina in the time of the prophet Muhammad—may play well with voters, but it offers no long-term solutions to the country's deep economic problems. It seems unlikely that Islamabad will get its act together soon. Over more than seven decades, neither Pakistan's overbearing military nor its feckless politicians have provided the sustained good governance needed for economic development. Unfortunately, these problems do not look like they will be shrinking any time soon.

Protests continue across Pakistan, with several other parties claiming their mandates were stolen.³⁶

In its report, the Free and Fair Election Network, or FAFEN, an Islamabad observer group, said: “Many election officials failed to follow rules or make necessary arrangements to gather results promptly. More than a dozen people have died in postelection violence.”³⁷

The newly elected parliament will be sworn in in the next two weeks. The house will then elect its leader, who will serve as the prime minister. With Khan so far refusing to build an alliance with Zardari's PPP, the latter has agreed to throw his weight behind a coalition government led by PMLN. Analysts say that a minority government with no legitimacy will not survive for an exceptionally long time, despite the backing of the establishment.³⁸

Raza Rumi in his article “Elections 2024: Militabishment Should Accept Defeat’ published in The Friday Times, on February 13, 2024, argued that:³⁹

The farcical elections, instead of showing a path to stability, have plunged Pakistan into a deeper crisis. Widespread allegations of vote rigging have rendered the entire exercise dubious. The new coalition government led by Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PMLN-) and supported by the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) will be haunted by a deepening economic crisis and issues of legitimacy. The real winner of this election, i.e., Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaaf (PTI) claims that it has been robbed of its mandate - a clear and substantial majority in the center and Punjab province. PTI candidates, contesting as independents sans their electoral symbol, in addition to numerous coercive, administrative, and legal measures, have emerged as the single largest parliamentary group. This by itself was a major shock for the

Militablistment, and its current allies the PML-N and the PPP. The PMLN was exposed as a party of the past stuck in a time warp and the latter, despite vote gains, was unable to make headway in the Punjab. Election 2024 is a clear win for PTI and is going to bolster its fortunes in the coming years. In addition to the 90-plus PTI-backed independents who won the elections, reports suggest that the tally would have been higher if late-night interventions had not been made. PTI maintains that seats in Islamabad, Karachi, Lahore, and other parts of the country were manipulated in the early hours of February 9. The Election Commission of Pakistan and the judiciary would ultimately adjudicate on the veracity of these claims, but it will not be any time sandpit voters displayed immense passion and resilience and were largely peaceful in casting their protest vote. The ridiculous cases against Imran Khan, especially the infamous Iddah verdict, contributed to public anger. It was not just anger, but the strategic use of technology that enabled the party to mobilize its voters amid draconian restrictions on its candidates, public gatherings, and campaigning. The PML-N has faced a near-rout in its strongholds, such as Lahore, Gujranwala, and Faisalabad in the Punjab province. The prevalent impression that the PML-N was the establishment's choice did not go down well with the electorate. It also led to complacency among its candidates. This election should serve as a warning for the likes of the PML-N and the PPP that the era of dynastic politics is nearing extinction, not unlike India, where the Congress Party is becoming irrelevant, and its comeback seems next to impossible. Parties structured like a family enterprise are not going to attract the restive, increasingly middle-class, and urban voters. Short of a complete makeover, the old guard of national politics is becoming irrelevant to the younger population. Granted that the establishment played a key role in discrediting the PPP and the PML-N, they also are short of ideas as they encounter an unending wave of populism worsened by the economic downturn, inflation, and widening inequities. The establishment may have lost in the short term, but it has a history of rising like a phoenix. Its ideal arrangement is a weak, pliable civilian government that can protect the military's hegemony. But the sagging popularity of khakis, especially in their home ground — the Punjab province — will be a cause for concern. This is why there will be a need to recalibrate the institution's policy towards Imran Khan. The latter has already declared on numerous occasions that he is willing to talk. Now, that time may have arrived, and within a year or sooner, a negotiated settlement cannot be ruled out. The past year's events are also a testament to the fact that older tactics of repression, coercion, and trampling of the popular sentiment do not work in the digital age. The encroachments made into the civilian space and policymaking are untenable. The sooner the generals realize this, the better it is for the institution and the country.

In a surprising development, Jamaat-e-Islami (JI) chief Sirajul Haq has said that the government should be given to the one who has been given the mandate by the people. Siraj said that the result of the elections led to increased polarization as the people decided one thing, but the results were different.

The JI chief claimed that a government imposed by force would not last, as the 2024 election was the most polluted and infamous one because the census itself was incorrect. Siraj said that the government does not run with fake elections and fake results. He claimed that great injustice had been done with his party which the common people were admitting, saying that seats were snatched in Karachi. Instead of elections, he said, they would have given their share to the people. Siraj demanded that the one who was given the mandate by the people should get the government.⁴⁰

Irfan Ghauri, in his article "Call for accountability amidst chaos" published in the Express Tribune, on February 19, 2024, maintained that:⁴¹

The resonance of Pakistan's 2024 elections has gone far beyond its borders, with regional and international media vehemently denouncing the process as exceptionally unfair, non-transparent, and heavily rigged in the nation's history. Amid this uproar, an informal alliance comprising the PTI, the JUI, the JI, the GDA, and some other smaller groups has been mobilizing nationwide protests against the alleged rigging, adding another layer to an already complex and highly unstable political scenario. The startling admission by the Rawalpindi division commissioner, Liaqat Ali Chatha, has introduced yet another layer of turmoil to the nation's precarious political landscape. His shocking revelation of orchestrating large-scale election rigging, including the addition of forged votes and manipulation of results, has sent shockwaves through the country. Here a question emerges: if the commissioner's avowal is true then why should only he bear the consequences while the alleged masterminds behind these machinations spanning dozens of national and provincial assemblies' constituencies across the country remain untouched? The responsibility for these shameless acts of election rigging squarely falls on the interim government, because its only mandate was to stay in power till a new government elected through a process of free and fair elections comes to power. However, the motivations and driving forces behind such manipulations remain a puzzle that needs unraveling to shed light on the murky underbelly of Pakistan's political system. Analyzing the power dynamics, the blame game unfolds across many potential bases of power: The Interim government, the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP), the PML-N and the PPP, the Pakistan Telecommunication Authority (PTA), the establishment, and the superior judiciary. Despite the interim government's significant leverage over civil servants, it lacks the power to coerce them into such egregious acts of betrayal. The ECP, often perceived as having authority over district returning officers (DROs), lacks the influence to prevent the civil administration from engaging in election rigging. However, like these elections, many past elections have highlighted the ECP's failure to incorporate mechanisms ensuring transparency in the polling and result tabulation process, demanding a thorough investigation. Despite being granted legal powers and resources through comprehensive legislative mechanisms, the ECP consistently introduces so-called novel technology-based systems in every election, only to face repeated failures. Following the 2018 RTS debacle, the much-anticipated Election Management System, designed to compile and transmit results promptly, also faltered in the February 8 elections. Political powerhouses like the PML-N in Punjab, the PPP in Sindh, and the MQM-P in Karachi, known for their ability to foster loyalties, are considered insufficient to coerce the civil bureaucracy into committing crimes that could dangerously plunge the country into civil strife. The establishment, recognized for its independent actions, allegedly asserts dominance over civilian institutions, relegating them to inconsequential roles.... Commissioner Chatha's admission of responsibility, deflecting blame from the real players, underscores the coercion faced by individuals and their families until they capitulate. A comprehensive investigation is imperative to restore public confidence in Pakistan's electoral infrastructure. Yet, a looming question is who will conduct such an investigation in a country where serious national crimes are often swept under the carpet? Political parties victimized in one election become integral to maneuvering in the next, perpetuating a vicious cycle. The influential ruling class continues to thrive at the expense of the suffering masses who cast their votes, while ordinary political workers endure hardships, hoping for a better future. However, this status quo cannot persist indefinitely.

Meanwhile, the European Union (EU) has joined the United States (US) and the United Kingdom (UK) in raising concerns over the transparency of the general elections in Pakistan. In an official statement, the (EU) stated: ⁴²

The European Union takes note of the completion of the polling in the general elections, which took place on 8 February in Pakistan, following several months of postponement and uncertainty, and in a context of a tense security environment.” The participation by the Pakistani people to exercise their right to vote, despite systemic barriers still faced by women and persons belonging to minorities, demonstrates their commitment to democracy and the rule of law. The EU welcomes the increased number of women registered to vote compared to the last elections. We regret the lack of a level playing field due to the inability of some political actors to contest the elections, restrictions to freedom of assembly, freedom of expression both online and offline, restrictions of access to the internet, as well as allegations of severe interference in the electoral process, including arrests of political activists. We therefore call upon the relevant authorities to ensure a timely and full investigation of all reported election irregularities and to implement the recommendations of the upcoming EU Election Expert Mission report. The authorities were faced with the challenging task of countering serious terrorist threats and attacks. The EU condemns all acts of violence, which took place in the lead-up to the elections and calls on all parties and actors to use peaceful and democratic mechanisms to settle differences, refraining from further violence. The EU attaches paramount importance to political pluralism, democratic values, independent media, vibrant civil society, judicial independence, and international human rights standards, which are key for democratic elections. We call on all political actors in Pakistan to engage in a peaceful and inclusive dialogue aiming at the formation of a stable government and to respect human rights in line with the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, as well as with international treaties to which Pakistan is a party. Pakistan is an important partner for the European Union, and we look forward to continuing to work with the Government of Pakistan on the priorities agreed in the EU-Pakistan Strategic Engagement Plan. We encourage Pakistan to continue reforms in the areas of human rights, good governance, as well as labor rights, and environmental standards, to address the shortcomings outlined in the GSP+ report of November 2023, and to continue the necessary economic reforms.

Charlie Campbell in his article entitled “Pakistan’s Military Used Every Trick to Sideline Imran Khan—and Failed. Now What?” published in the Time on February 9, 2024, reported that: ⁴³

He’s been shot, jailed, had his political party effectively banned, and his name purged from mainstream media. But you just can’t keep Imran Khan down. Preliminary results from Thursday’s election in Pakistan seem to show that independent candidates affiliated with Khan’s Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) party have a chance of securing a plurality of legislative seats despite myriad irregularities, which continued through polling day, designed to hobble such an outcome. The PTI already had its famed cricket-bat logo banned, and a nationwide suspension of cellphone networks on Thursday hindered party officials from informing supporters of their preferred independent candidate for each constituency. (The government claimed the blackout was for security reasons despite such measures being deemed illegal by Pakistan’s High Court.) In addition, exit polls were banned and the PTI complained that their agents were barred from monitoring polling stations. “The amount of rigging going on is beyond ridiculous,” Zulfikar Bukhari, a former Minister of State under Khan, tells TIME. Still, when results finally started trickling in—over 10 hours later than customary, which observers say is highly suspicious—the PTI was neck and neck with the Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) of three-time former Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif, with the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) led by Bilawal Bhutto Zardari, son of assassinated ex-Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto, in third place. Sharif is the preferred candidate of Pakistan’s powerful military, which, despite backing his ouster thrice in the past, recently

allowed the 74-year-old back from exile in the U.K., quashed his corruption conviction, and repealed his lifetime ban from politics. Sharif's speedy rehabilitation stood in stark contrast to the generals' Khan-and-PTI purge. "No one rules without the tacit support of the military," says Maya Tudor, an associate professor of government and public policy at Oxford University. "What's different this time is how overtly the military is targeting the PTI, because they have grassroots support and are technologically savvy." Yet even if the PTI, against all odds, secures a plurality of legislative seats, many obstacles to forming a government remain. Since its lawmakers are officially independents, there's no obligation for them to vote along party lines for key appointments, raising the prospect of coerced defections. Moreover, the PTI is not eligible for its share of the National Assembly's 70 "reserved seats" for women and minorities that are divvied up according to a party's proportion of the overall vote. And then there is the fact that Khan, 71, remains in prison and is unable to stand as a lawmaker himself. Even before the vote, there were widespread rumors of a power-sharing pact between the PML-N and PPP, with Sharif serving as prime minister and Zardari as president. A coalition between the two remains the most likely outcome. Still, the strength of PTI's showing is a bloody nose for Pakistan's military, which previously backed Khan before his 2018 election victory. However, the generals fell out spectacularly with the former national cricket captain and engineered his ouster in an April 2022 no-confidence vote. Since then, Khan has survived an assassination attempt and weathered a tsunami of over 180 legal challenges. In recent weeks alone, he received prison sentences totaling 31 years for corruption, leaking state secrets, and having an "un-Islamic" marriage. Yet his popularity remained strong leading up to the vote, especially among young Pakistanis, with voters aged 18-35 comprising 45% of the nearly 130 million-strong electorate. "It's very clear that the military was nervous and then to see PTI exceed expectations is a big blow," says Michael Kugelman, director of the South Asia Institute at the Wilson Center. The Pakistani public and political class now await the full results and, no doubt, much horse-trading to come. The nuclear-armed nation of 240 million can little afford a power vacuum with whoever ends up taking the top job facing no shortage of crises. ...And presuming Pakistan's military continues to pursue its goal of shutting the PTI out of power, the question remains how PTI supporters will react to their disenfranchisement, not least given the grim state of the economy. On May 9, PTI supporters ransacked military premises in response to an earlier, fleeting arrest of Khan. He may remain behind bars, but Thursday's election shows the sporting icon is far from done as a political force. "The military wants the next government to focus on economic recovery and hoped it could put the Imran Khan genie back into the bottle by having him in jail for a few years," says Kugelman. "But the challenges are only going to grow because the PTI base will only become more aggrieved."

Astha Rajvanshi in his article entitled "Pioneering Human Rights Lawyer Hina Jilani Warns of Pakistan's Unstable Future" published in Time on February 15, 2024, says that:⁴⁴

In the lead-up to this year's elections, HRCP began issuing warnings over electoral fairness, pointing to pre-poll vote rigging and blatant electoral manipulation. "At this point, there is little evidence to show that the upcoming elections will be free, fair, or credible," said HRCP co-chair Munizae Jahangir during a January press conference in Islamabad. A lot of what HRCP observed on the ground had already occurred in 2018 when pre-election engineering and military intelligence saw Khan coming into power in the first place. "There were well-documented incidents of candidates being forced to leave their party to join Imran Khan's party," Jilani says. "And when the military and Khan fell out and started exposing each other, it led to a lot of suspicion about the contiguity of the 2018 election results." Still, this year's results have managed to surprise everyone, including Jilani. "It's strange for me to say this, but I don't think the

Pakistani public has ever played a strong role in enforcing democracy in this country," she says. "Yes, there have been very brave, courageous people who have waged some kind of opposition or resistance, but we have not seen a public uprising against the military takeover of political space in this country. "It is for this reason that PTI's surprise win has also been so exceptional, Jilani says: "Despite the constraints imposed and attempts made by the military establishment to deter or discourage the voters from voting, there was still a vast number of people who did come out and vote. "What PTI-affiliated independents do next also matter greatly. "They may choose to join a different party," Jilani speculates. "On the other hand, the PTI has lost the status of a party, so they will have to find legal ways under the Constitution to declare themselves as a single party and form a government." And then there is the matter of Khan, who will remain an important political figure even after the government is formed, given that so many candidates are contesting in his name. "His party, the PTI, still exists. Now, it will have to do a lot of things in the right way," she says, referring to the slew of corruption allegations that PTI officials are currently facing in court.

Earlier, the US Department of State spokesperson Matthew Miller called for an investigation of rigging allegations in the Pakistan general results held on February 8.

On being asked about US lawmakers calling on the State Department not to accept the results of the Pakistan election until allegations of rigging are investigated, Miller said, "So we have called for those allegations to be investigated. We think that is the appropriate step to take. That's - that is our response to questions of irregularities not just in Pakistan, but when we see them anywhere in the world."

"We think that they're thoroughly investigated and resolved. And so that - we will continue to call for that. But at the same time, it is clear that the elections in Pakistan were competitive, and we look forward to working with the government, once it is formed, that the people of Pakistan elected," he added.

After days of speculation and anticipation, the PMLN, and the PPP have come together to form a coalition government in the wake of the 2024 general elections, which yielded a hung parliament.

Shehbaz Sharif has emerged as the consensus candidate for the position of prime minister, diverging from the original plan of having Nawaz Sharif in the lead role.

The PPP has agreed to support Shehbaz Sharif's candidacy, albeit with certain conditions attached.

The PPP is eyeing key constitutional positions of the Presidency, Senate chair, and National Assembly speakership, with the backing of the PMLN.

The coalition's strength will face a litmus test in Parliament, where they must secure enough votes for their government to be legitimized.

This new iteration of the Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) includes leaders from six parties, including defections from independent candidates backed by the PTI. Some of these individuals have already switched allegiance to joining the Sharifs' camp.

As it stands, the coalition formed by Shehbaz Sharif has amassed a total of 152 general seats. However, with his party holding only 75 out of the 336 seats in the National Assembly, a significant gap remains to achieve a majority.

To bolster their numbers, Shehbaz has hinted at courting independent lawmakers, with reports suggesting that 10 of them have already pledged their support.... PDM 2.0, the new coalition presented as a reconciliation effort, is poised to face challenges from its inception due to a lack of widespread popular support.⁴⁵

On February 16, 2024, PTI senior leader Barrister Gohar Ali Khan said Omar Ayub Khan would be the party's candidate for the office of prime minister and Mian Aslam Iqbal for the slot of Punjab chief minister. Gohar said the party was confident of Omar Ayub's election as prime minister and that he would stay until Imran was released.

He said the PTI which was in all the provinces and had a two-thirds majority in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab, was being limited and a party having zero credibility and barely 20 seats was being given power. The people will not accept such a mandate.

Gohar said his party had announced a peaceful protest of the alleged rigging and invited all parties, including Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam, Jamaat-e-Islami, and GDA, to participate in it on Saturday.

Speaking on the occasion, PTI leader Sher Afzal Marwat said, "We have placed the whole situation before Imran Khan and Khan Sahib is clear that we cannot share power with PMLN and PPP under any circumstances."

He said the PTI will show Form-45 of all the party-backed candidates who had been robbed of their win and Salman Akram Raja will give a presentation in this connection to the local and international media at a local hotel.

Asad alleged that the February 8 elections were the worst elections that had no credibility, and no one was ready to accept them. He charged that his party's mandate had been stolen against which a protest would be held across the country, and he would try to talk to different parties in this connection.⁴⁶

In a surprise move, Imran Khan has been desperately knocking at the doors of the US for help, which he had earlier blamed to be the major conspirators behind his ousting from the government.

From Khan's removal from the government to his arrest following the May 9 attacks and matters involving recently held elections in the country, Imran Khan has repeatedly approached the US either for his help or for its interference in the domestic politics of the country.

After no-confidence in April 2021, Khan has since blamed a US-led foreign conspiracy that also involved Pakistan's powerful military establishment and his political rivals.

Imran Khan claimed that the US "threatened" him and was seeking his removal from office as he faced a no-confidence vote that could mean the end of his premiership.

However, in November 2021 Khan signaled his readiness to mend fences with the US after repeatedly accusing Washington of conspiring to remove him from power in April.

The US chapter of PTI also hired two lobbying firms in the US to make Americans aware of the threat to Imran Khan's life. The move highlighted PTI's efforts to win over sympathies for Khan in the US where he is not immensely popular.

Before his arrest on the May 9 attacks, Imran Khan again spoke to US Democrat lawmakers Ted Lieu, Eric Swalwell, Brad Sherman, and Mike Levin, urging them to support his demand for free and fair elections in Pakistan.

When Khan was arrested following the May 9 attacks, an alleged audio leak of a Zoom meeting surfaced between him and US Congresswoman Maxine Moore Waters in which he pleaded for congresswomen's support and her voice to favor him.

Another red line was crossed when the PTI-led rally in the US sought support from them to impose sanctions on the military alleging violation of human rights. The accusations of rights violations follow the crackdown on leaders of the PTI as well as workers, after the May 9 attacks which targeted key military institutions including the GHQ and the Lahore corps commander's residence.

In the PTI rally held outside the White House, it was also reported that the PTI leaders also urged the Biden administration not to deal with an extremely unpopular government, which has no moral justification for continuing to rule Pakistan.

Before the general elections, PTI's US chapter again hired a new public relations and lobbying firm to monitor Pakistan polls and to engage with the US and international media.

Meanwhile, Khan said that the US did not fulfill its duty against the anti-PTI measures, adding that America has always patronized and imposed dictators and installed corrupt people as rulers.

Khan stressed that it was an opportunity for the US to rectify its past actions and added that the US should keep monitoring election rigging in Pakistan. Imran Khan said that it is America's responsibility to raise its voice on the transparency of elections in Pakistan. He lamented that the US acts like the voice of democracy in the entire world, but both the US and Europe have maintained silence on rigging in the elections in Pakistan. He further said that the US should pressurize those involved in rigging instead of issuing such cosmetic statements.⁴⁷

Meanwhile, in a surprising development, Hafiz Naeem ur Rehman of the Jamaat-e-Islami party had been named the victor of the provincial assembly seat PS-129 in the city of Karachi.

But this week he claimed the candidate backed by Imran Khan's PTI party had secured far more votes and that their tally had been reduced.

As such he would relinquish the seat.

"If anyone wants to make us win illegitimately, we will not be accepting that," Mr. Rehman said at a press conference held by his party on Monday.

He added: "Public opinion should be respected, let the winner win, let the loser lose, no one should get anything extra."

He said that while he had received more than 26,000 votes, the independent candidate Saif Bari, backed by the PTI, had gotten 31,000 votes - but these were presented as 11,000 votes.

Pakistani electoral authorities have denied the allegations. It is unclear who will accept the PS-129 seat now.

But the incident is just the latest highlighting the crisis around Pakistan's elections held earlier, which have been marred by allegations of widespread vote fraud and interference, which damaged candidates affiliated with Khan.⁴⁸

However, the PTI argues such candidates should have won even more votes and more seats. They have alleged numerous instances of vote rigging and welcomed the Islamist party's relinquishing of the Karachi seat.

Meanwhile, US State Department spokesperson Matthew Miller says the US has called for rigging allegations in Pakistan general elections to be investigated.

On February 14, 2024, Matthew Miller said the US thinks that an investigation of rigging is an appropriate step to take. "That is our response to questions of irregularities not just in Pakistan, but when we see them anywhere in the world and we think that they're thoroughly investigated and resolved," he said. Replying to a question, he said elections in Pakistan were competitive, and we look forward to working with the government, once it is formed, that the people of Pakistan elected. He said the formation of a coalition government is an internal matter of Pakistan. That is not a decision for the US to make. It is a decision for Pakistan to make. Miller said several countries have parliamentary systems of government, where no party gains a majority, and some kind of coalition governments are formed.⁴⁹

Zahid Hussain in his article "Polls and their aftermath" published in Dawn on February 14, 2024, said that:⁵⁰

It was perhaps the most consequential election in Pakistan's recent history. Defying all odds, the voters turned out in record numbers. They have spoken aloud and clearly and given their verdict. It was a vote for hope and democracy. But the people's mandate seems to have been stolen yet again. Events in the run-up to the elections had left little faith in the fairness of the polls. Still, the people came out, breaking down the walls of fear and hoping to bring change through the power of the ballot. The massive turnout of youth and women voters made a difference. It was a protest vote against political repression and the status quo. The anti-establishment sentiment was quite palpable. The voting trend and initial poll results from Punjab and KP indicated a total rout of parties seen as having the military's backing, in particular the PML-N. The PTI candidates took the lead in major constituencies. Yet the final tally showed an incredibly different result. Many of the PMLN heavyweights who were lagging far behind PTI-affiliated candidates till late night were declared the winners the next morning. How this amazing turnaround happened is anybody's guess. However, it was a different story in KP, where the result could not be altered much. The PTI held its ground in its main bastion. It is certainly not the first time that the country has witnessed such a mysterious overnight turnaround of poll results. We saw it, too, in the 2018 elections. It all depends on who is the favorite of the security establishment at the time. There was no doubt that the PTI was the main beneficiary of the 'hand of God' in the previous election. But what happened this time has hardly any precedent. It was a protest vote against political repression and the status quo. The large-scale poll irregularities have drawn a strong international reaction. The US, the UK, and the European Union have separately expressed concerns about Pakistan's electoral process and urged a probe into the reported irregularities. But the most damning statement on the elections came from the UN secretary general, who called on the Pakistani authorities and political leaders to resolve the issues related to the election "through the established legal frameworks" and to refrain from taking any action that could raise tensions. It is almost unprecedented for a UN official to make such remarks

on an issue generally considered to be a country's internal matter. These statements by the international community cannot be brushed aside. They clearly show the worsening global perception of Pakistan's democratic process. It also brings into question the alleged involvement of the security establishment in manipulating the electoral process. Its footprints could be seen all over. Despite the alleged irregularities, the PTI-backed 'independents' have emerged as the single largest particular group in the next National Assembly. However, since the PTI is not recognized as a parliamentary party, it cannot get its share of some 70 reserved seats for women and religious minorities. Hence, the party cannot achieve even a simple majority to form a government at the center. Moreover, it would be extremely tough for the group to maintain its unity in the face of intimidation by the security agencies and horse-trading. Meanwhile, a new power play has begun, disregarding all democratic norms. Wheeling and dealing are the name of the game. It is all about power and control that has brought together vested interests. ...Sharif called for the formation of a unity government, comprising all the major parties, including the independents. He has also talked about a healing touch to unite the nation. It all sounds good, but it does not go beyond rhetoric. In a similar statement, the army chief also urged Pakistan's political parties to form a "unified government" to help the country move on from the politics of "anarchy and polarization." It is rare for an army chief to issue such political statements. It is not the mandate of the military leadership to tell the political leadership what kind of government there should be. But given the deep involvement of the security establishment in the political power equation, it has not come as a surprise. It also provides some insight into the emerging civil-military relationship. The security establishment's domination in the anticipated political set-up is likely to strengthen in a politically divided country. The unity that Sharif and the army chief are calling for cannot be achieved with the distortion of the democratic process. The allegation of election irregularities has further destabilized the country.... The political fallout of a questionable electoral process cannot be easily resolved. Surely the country needs a healing touch but that can only happen by restoring the democratic rights of the people.

Husain Haqqani, in his article "Moving Forward after the Election," published in The News on February 15, 2024, argued that:⁵¹

The unexpected results of Pakistan's twelfth general election, held on February 8, have created both a threat and an opportunity for the country. The threat is one of political deadlock and confrontation; the opportunity is for defining a political way forward that is different from Pakistan's turbulent past. Most observers agree that voters expressed their disdain for establishment meddling in politics and showed disapproval for high-handedness and repression by voting for Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) affiliated independents. The PTI deserves credit for pushing back against restrictions and intimidation to mobilize its support base -- young Pakistanis angry with the status quo and lack of opportunities, unimpressed by corruption and dynastic politics, and looking upon Imran Khan as the country's savior. Imran Khan, once the establishment's choice, has benefited from the narrative built over three decades to describe traditional politicians (and others questioning the establishment's policy prescriptions) as 'crooks or traitors.' The establishment may have realized in 2022 that polarizing the nation is not a recipe for national success, but its traditional constituencies have not. Imran Khan has used the establishment's decision to stop supporting his polarizing rhetoric to turn establishment-supporting voters against the establishment.... There is no doubt that the PTI was denied a level playing field in the elections, as has been the case with any party disfavored by the establishment in past Pakistani elections as well. But past victims of the establishment negotiated with other political parties bargained with the establishment and found a way forward. Allegations of poll rigging are unlikely to change the fact that the PTI will not

be able to form a government either at the center or in Punjab. The PTI has refused to talk to other major parties and its numbers alone are not enough to constitute a parliamentary majority. Petitions for recounts or repolling in individual seats could take a long time to wend their way through the legal system. Every Pakistani election has been followed by one or another party complaining about its mandate being stolen, sometimes with good reason. But eventually, elected assemblies are convened, governments are formed, and life goes on. Although Pakistan's politics can take unexpected turns at any time, the chances that social media activism and a vocal younger generation's frustrations will lead to a revolutionary overthrow of the existing order appear slim now. It is true that the PTI is facing the brunt of state repression and is, therefore, gaining sympathy. But the legacy political parties that have been targets of similar repression in the past are far from decimated. The formation of government by parties other than the largest group is known in parliamentary democracies after an inconclusive election. Pakistan needs a government to deal with critical issues such as negotiations with the IMF and other creditors over a new economic bailout. Both the PML and PPP realize that taking the helm of Pakistan at this moment amounts to wearing a crown of thorns. The PML seems willing to do it while others have their eye on the next election. Not having a functioning government would be worse than having a weak government. Instead of letting uncertainty and instability persist, Pakistan's politicians could take a path they have never taken before. They could forsake personal conflicts, and extreme narratives portraying each other as irreconcilable enemies engaged in battle, to form a government of national unity. The PTI could join it, state repression could end, and genuine national reconciliation could begin.

Abid Hussain, in his article 'Mandate thieves': New Pakistan government takes shape amid a slew of Jabs" published on Aljazeera, on February 14, 2024, maintained that:⁵²

With the assembly session expected to start on February 29, critics of the PMLN-led alliance are raising questions about the sustainability of the incoming government, drawing parallels with the Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) coalition that ruled the country for 16 months starting April 2022.

The PDM, led by the PMLN and PPP, had come to power after deposing then-Prime Minister Khan through a vote of no confidence — much like the PTI and its supporters are accusing the six-party coalition of conspiring to keep them out of office. Shehbaz Sharif, the prime minister during the PDM tenure, has once again been nominated as the coalition's choice for prime minister. Bilawal Bhutto-Zardari, the chairperson of the PPP and a foreign minister during the PDM government, had earlier ruled himself out of the race for prime minister, accepting that his party had not received the mandate for the top job. The PMLN's Iqbal said that facing political and economic instability, parties must set aside differences after the election to work together. The former federal minister said that instead of pursuing "negative politics," every party must now focus on competing on governance and delivery.

"Traditional parties are seasoned. They have learned the art of competition and collaboration simultaneously. They compete for their partisan politics but also can forge collaboration on national issues. Unlike PTI, which is always in confrontation mode," Iqbal added.

"Government and opposition are wheels of the same cart, and on national issues, they both must talk to each other. "We will again reach out to everybody in the parliament for a consensus on a charter of the economy and try to persuade them to work on such matters together," he said.

PTI's Bukhari, though, argued that Pakistan has already seen the performance of the PDM once and that the six-party coalition had nothing new to offer.

Bukhari, who is also an adviser to Khan, said that his party's foremost priority is to seek "justice" regarding the alleged manipulation of the elections.

He added that the party will pursue legal avenues, as well as "show proof of rigging, both nationally and internationally."

"We are happy to sit back and wait for the courts and ECP to decide on our cases, as we firmly believe that our rightful mandate was stolen and we will go to every length to get back what is ours," Bukhari said.

"Till then, though, we will present the toughest, most robust, and constructive opposition in the country's history." A six-party alliance appears poised to form Pakistan's next government, after a week of political drama following⁵³

Omar Waraich, in his article "Angry Young Pakistanis Give Imran Khan a Future Shot at Power" published in Foreign Policy on February 12, 2024, maintained that:⁵⁴

Immured in his prison cell, Pakistani politician Imran Khan could scarcely have hoped for a better result. Just days before the country's Feb. 8 election, the cricket legend-turned-populist politician was sentenced to more than a decade behind bars in three trumped-up cases. His party was stripped of its signature cricket bat symbol by the Election Commission, denying voters the chance to identify the party on ballot papers—a critical aspect of voting in a country where 40 percent of people are illiterate—and forcing its candidates to run as independents. Its members were beaten, imprisoned, and driven into rival parties or out of politics altogether.

On polling day, cell phone signals vanished, and internet access was choked. After the votes were cast, there were widespread allegations that many were stolen overnight, reversing unassailable leads. And yet, despite every effort to thwart them, Khan's supporters recorded the highest number of votes and clinched the largest number of seats.

Independent candidates affiliated with Khan's party, who took 93 out of a total of 295 national seats and won one province outright, were denied the majority that they insist they won and may be excluded from government, but the vote represents a momentous development. A new generation of voters has emerged—concentrated in Pakistan's heaving towns and cities—who now demand a break with history. These voters want to have the power to choose their leaders, not leave the country in the hands of the powerful military that has maintained a granitic grip on politics for most of its history.

When Khan fell out with the generals that brought him to power and was ousted from office in April 2022, his young supporters mounted vast, sometimes violent protests. Despite a vicious crackdown over the next two years, they persevered and demonstrated their defiance in the only way left to them: through a peaceful, democratic vote.

The determination of young voters to decide their futures may become a trend this year in the global south as billions go to the polls in at least 64 countries. Pakistan has an increasingly young and growing population. With the fifth-largest population in the world, nearly half of all eligible voters are aged 35 and younger. Since the last election, in 2018, 21 million new voters have been registered. That trend will inexorably continue over the next couple of decades—Pakistan is home to about 100 million people under the age of 18.

This is a generation of Pakistanis who have grown up with the sense of being a nation long denied its promise: mired in economic difficulty, scarred by years of terrorism, ravaged by climate change, dismayed by how their country is perceived in the world, and angry at the feckless and venal elites that have reduced them to this ruin.

For many of these voters, Khan represented something new. In the lead-up to the 2018 election, he stirred rare feelings of national pride, something that he has proved effective at ever since lifting Pakistan's only Cricket World Cup trophy in 1992. They liked his charisma, his religious fervor, his charity work, and his celebrity. Khan skillfully tapped this mood for change, casting himself as a man of destiny who would single-handedly sweep away the country's many problems and suddenly lift Pakistan to the glory it deserved.

There was little scrutiny of the plausibility of his promises. It was enough that someone was making them.

At the time, Khan's popularity was significant but not decisive. The military had grown weary of the two political dynasties that had dominated the fitful periods of civilian rule in the country, the center-right Sharifs of the Muslim League, and the center-left Bhutto-Zardaris of the People's Party. In Khan, the military saw someone who, with his confident English and Oxford University education, could provide a useful civilian veneer as it clung to the main levers of power.

The 2018 election that thrust Khan into the prime minister's house was marred by many of the "irregularities" that his supporters now complain of a former prime minister in prison, a tilted electoral playing field, intimidation of candidates, and a late-night burst of creative arithmetic.

During his three and a half years in government, Khan proved a disappointment to his supporters and a danger to his critics and opponents. His cabinet was full of familiar, shop-worn faces, including his foreign minister and interior minister, plucked from the same ruling elite that he had railed against. None of the dreams that he promised materialized. The economy shambled modestly, with a few new welfarist schemes rolled out.

Michael Kugelman, in his article "How Imran Khan's Party Stunned Pakistan," said that.

"The Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf party won't take power, but it capitalized on public discontent to deliver a rebuke to the establishment." ⁵⁵

Meanwhile, a four-party alliance, comprising the National Party (NP), Balochistan National Party (BNP), Pakhtunkhwa Mili Awami Party (PKMAP), and Hazara Democratic Party, is staging a demonstration in front of the district returning office (DRO) in Quetta over alleged rigging in the polls.

The protesters have demanded election results to be issued based on Form 45.

Meanwhile, workers of the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) have staged a sit-in in front of the returning officer's (RO) office against alleged manipulation of election results in Naseerabad.

Meanwhile, in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), Miranshah-Bannu and Shewah-Mir Ali roads have been blocked by protesters belonging from the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) and the Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam-Fazl (JUI-F).⁵⁶

government.

On February 18 Commissioner Rawalpindi Liaqat Ali Chatha resigned from his position after acknowledging that there had been alleged electoral manipulation in 2024.

Chattha acknowledged that election tampering occurred and that under his supervision, candidates with a lead in their constituencies and over 70,000 votes were turned into losers with the use of fictitious seals.

Barrister Gohar from the PTI called for a quick investigation into the claims of rigging made by the Commissioner. He claimed that the Commissioner had to identify the victorious candidates when he declared that they had been defeated.

The PTI leader claimed, "We were winning the election based on Form 45, but later our candidates were defeated with Form 47." The Commissioner's statement, according to Barrister Gohar, is extremely serious. "If we go towards a new election, we have to open Pandora's Box," he continued.

On February 19, 2024, it was announced that independent candidates backed by Pakistan's jailed former prime minister who won seats in the elections will join the minority Sunni Ittehad Council, a political party, to form a government.

Parties are allocated 70 reserved seats - 60 for women, 10 for non-Muslims - in proportion to the number of seats won. This completes the National Assembly's total 336 seats. Independents are not eligible for reserved seats.⁵⁷

Zahid Hussain in his article "Hybrid rule 3.0" published in Dawn, on February 21, 2024, says that:⁵⁸

It is a royal mess that is hard to clean up. A hung parliament through a controversial election has pushed the country deeper into the mire. It has been almost two weeks since the general elections were held on Feb 8, but there is no sign of a new dispensation taking shape. A thick cloud of uncertainty continues to hang over the country's political landscape. While the PTI is still not out of the race, the two other major political parties — the PML-N and PPP — are engaged in **hard bargaining** for the formation of a **new coalition arrangement**, amid **widespread protests** against alleged poll rigging. The **confession** of the Rawalpindi commissioner, who resigned from his post, about his role in vote manipulation has raised more questions about the legitimacy of the entire electoral process. It is certainly not the outcome of the long-awaited polls one wanted to see. It is the unraveling of the entire political power structure. But re-engineering work is on to prop up the old order already rejected by the electorate. The intermittent shutdown of social media seems to be a part of the effort to stifle opposition voices. One is, however, not sure whether these efforts will bring any political stability to a country in deep turmoil with the official result of the elections now almost fully compiled, the PTI-supported independent bloc is ahead of the other political parties in the next National Assembly, despite the alleged electoral manipulation. The PTI's **latest decision to merge** its parliamentary party with the Sunni Ittehad Council in the House is supposed to be part of its tactics to get its share of some 70 reserve seats, thus keeping the group in the race to form the new government engineering work is on to prop up the old order already rejected by the electorate. Moreover, the PTI leadership also seems hopeful of snatching some more seats by **challenging** some controversial results in court. But it will still be difficult for the party to get the required number to form the government at the center on its own. The party has already declared it will not enter into any power-sharing arrangement with the PML-N and PPP. Yet its formidable presence in the National Assembly could present a constant challenge to a prospective PML-N-led coalition

government. The PTI's decision to stay in the game seems to have frustrated the plan that aimed to completely sideline the party. Notwithstanding the alleged manipulations, the elections have changed the country's political dynamics making it extremely hard for the ubiquitous security establishment to set its own rules. Its leadership seems to have come out bruised in the process and has been a vote against the military's role in political powerplay as well as its overarching presence in almost all aspects of the state. Yet there is no indication of the generals taking a back seat. Instead, the meddling of the security establishment in politics is likely to be enhanced, given the fragmented electoral mandate. Its reported role in pushing the PML-N and PPP to reach an agreement on the formation of a coalition government has not been denied. While there appears to be consensus among the PPP and smaller parties to support Shehbaz Sharif, the PML-N nominee for prime minister, there is no agreement yet on the power-sharing formula. The PPP, whose support is crucial for any future set-up, is playing hard to get on the issue of joining the cabinet, while bargaining for key constitutional positions, including the post of president. The PPP has maintained its control over Sindh and is also poised to lead a coalition government in Balochistan, raising the stakes in the power game. Past master in the politics of wheeling and dealing, Asif Ali Zardari is trying to extract maximum advantage for his party before finally agreeing to the PPP joining the government. The party has already made it public that Zardari will be a candidate for president. The issue seems to be a sticking point in the ongoing negotiations between the two parties. Meanwhile, there also seems to be establishment pressure on the party to be a part of the incoming administration rather than supporting it from the outside. If a deal is struck, the future ruling coalition will not be different from the previous Shehbaz Sharif-led hybrid administration, with the security establishment having a significant role in all policy matters. Most interesting, however, is Nawaz Sharif's decision to stand down as a candidate for prime minister. The party's entire election campaign had revolved around his return to power. It seems that his party's failure to achieve even a simple majority was the main reason for the withdrawal of his candidature. He did not want to lead a coalition government that would include the PP. So, Shehbaz Sharif, who has worked well with the military as well as other political parties in the past, is considered the right choice to lead the future coalition government. Nawaz Sharif has, however, made sure that the mantle of Punjab chief minister will go to his daughter and heir apparent Maryam Nawaz. Being the largest single party in the Punjab Assembly, the PMLN may not have any difficulty in forming the government in the province, with the support of some independents not associated with the PTI. Some of them have already jumped onto the PMLN's bandwagon. Maryam Nawaz's nomination marks the continuation of the dynastic control of the Sharif family over Punjab. What is most problematic, however, is the issue of different political parties ruling the provinces. While the Sindh government, led by the PPP, can coexist with the ruling coalition at the center, it will not be easy for the PTI government in KP to work with the PMLN administration in Islamabad. These inherent problems would make it extremely difficult for a minority government at the center to deliver on the critical problems related to governance, economy, and internal security. There is no way the system can work in this atmosphere of confrontation. The future does not look that good for the country, post-election.

Arifa Noor in her article "A Giant's Strength," published in Dawn on February 20, 2024, argues that:⁵⁹

It is time to be worried. Worried for Pakistan. Our political engineering formula has come undone. The Hawa which was blowing hard could not secure a win for the blue-eyed party and engineer an election in Punjab. The ever capricious electables have been playing up for some time now and refuse to swing around with the wind. And parties refuse to fall apart quietly after the first dozen or so among

their leadership are given a software update. And then, the people. Decades ago, it was decided they were illiterate, poor, and desperate for money, and hence the political process could be reduced to 'they sell their vote for a few thousand, let's not blame them,' while the more organized or better off went for the promise of a *nali* (drain) or *sadak* (road). But this time around, the poor and the *sadak* lovers have changed their colors. Their blood has also turned white. Caste and community no longer mean the political world to them. They have turned into selfish adults who want to exercise the individual right to vote, even encouraging their mothers and sisters to think similarly. The absence of the bat did not confuse them, for the wily creatures used smartphones, believing it over mainstream media. Instead of the meek, the tech-savvy are threatening to inherit the earth. Resultantly, those who are clinging on [decided to switch off Twitter](#) (X). Crisis management does not get more effective than this. After all, as far as tactics go, it is subtler than upturning results in constituencies where the infamous Form 45s were handed out long before someone found out that it was not enough to beat people black and blue, and that races must be managed. It seems as if those who had made sure no one got hold of Form 45 in 2018 have been sent home and an undergraduate lot, which still has not attended Post-Poll Rigging 101, is in charge. That PDM 2.0 is about to be revived is a triumph of hope over experience. The civilian side is not handling the new breakups and romances well either. One political party ran a superb campaign rooted in the 1990s for an election taking place in 2024. It came second but was the first to hold a victory celebration and declare itself the biggest party. Confusion over numbers or just confidence in the engineers? Who knows? But they tried to wiggle out of the federal government once the PPP began playing hard to get; however, the confession of a Rawalpindi commissioner soon put an end to their airs. Since then, no sources are reporting that the PML-N is considering not forming the government at the center, and just clinging to Punjab. (The questions over the north Punjab results do not just reduce their already miserable National Assembly number but also the majority on which Maryam Nawaz will stroll into the chief minister's house.) In the confusion, no one bothers to ask who designed and ran that uninspiring election campaign, which got them to the 80-seat mark in an election, where no one else was contesting. Considering they ran Islamabad directly since April 2022 and had a say in Punjab since the caretakers came in and still barely scraped through in the election, it is hard to imagine how they plan to reverse this trend by governing directly. But who dares ask difficult questions at this moment? The PPP continues to blow hot and scorn PMLN while forming committees and holding meetings for a power-sharing formula. (As an aside, I recently learned of 'breadcrumbing in relationships.) It is worth pondering why no one believes the PPP and is convinced it will end up in government yet again. Does it have something to do with the fact that after the son announced the tough decision taken in the party's two-day meeting, the other chairman suddenly appeared at a [press conference of senior citizens](#) who laid claim to government-making at the home of Chaudhry Shujaat? Perhaps, there is no greater sign of the times than the visuals of that press conference with the good Chaudhry seated in the middle. He headed the king's party of the 1990s. That PDM 2.0 (or the senior citizens club) is about to be revived is a triumph of hope over experience. This time around, it will manage the IMF and conduct reform while saving itself and the country from its perennial finance minister. Then we have the PTI, a party that maintains confusion among its ranks, whether there is one page or not, whether in power or opposition, and whether it is underground or not. Such consistency of confusion must be applauded, for the party rarely stays the course in any other field. It is claiming a marvelous result in the election (the dominant view on social media) and the governments at the center, and in Lahore and Peshawar, even though it still does not have a symbol (of any party) after having held talks with nearly every religion-political party other than the TLP. Also, [choosing a general for a chief minister](#), it is indicating that it's ready for a face-

off, with KP as its fortress. The confusion within it is only bound to increase as access to its leader is restricted and the lawyers and politicians figure out how to proceed. But with Sheikh Waqas Akram, Ali Mohammad Khan, Latif Khosa, and Sher Afzal Marwat leading the assault in the National Assembly, Shehbaz Sharif will for the first time in his life find out what an opposition is all about. It might just end up being a bigger surprise for him than 1999 when he was said to be sleeping as his brother chose a new COAS. In all of this, one can only hope we will bury the myth — among many others — of an election bringing about stability and quiet. That old ‘analysis’ is about as relevant as a text message, and it should be dropped along with the caretaker government (one waits with bated breath), as we brace ourselves for not just PDM 2.0 but also instability pro max. On February 20, 2024, the PPP and the PMLN reached a formal agreement to form a coalition government, ending ten days of intense negotiations after an inconclusive national election did not return a clear majority. Shehbaz Sharif, the younger brother of Nawaz, would be the coalition's candidate for prime minister. The delay in forming a government has caused concern as Pakistan is grappling with an economic crisis amid slow growth and record inflation, rising militant violence, and needs a stable administration with the authority to make tough decisions.

According to Pakistan’s constitution, a session of parliament must be called by February 29 after which a vote for a new prime minister will take place.⁶⁰

Meanwhile, markets on February 21, 2024, reacted positively to the news of an alliance, which removed days of uncertainty. Pakistan's benchmark share index rose 1.81%. The index had fallen more than 5% since the elections.

Pakistan bonds recovered after three straight days of falls. The December 2027 bond was the biggest gainer, rising 2.58 cents, closely followed by the April 2031 bond which rose 2.54 cents.

PML-N's 79 and the PPP's 54 seats together make a simple majority in parliament to form a government, which, however, will also rope in smaller parties in the coalition.

Candidates backed by Imran Khan won 93 seats, but do not have the numbers to form a government. He and his party have rejected the results of the elections, alleging widespread rigging.

On February 21, 2024, the PPP official said that the deal between it and the PMLN to form a coalition government will be based on “conditional support” and that the party “will review decisions on a case-by-case basis”. The PPP is not taking cabinet positions, and its support in parliament would depend on the party's stance. In return for supporting the formation of government by PMLN, the PPP will seek the chair of the upper house of the parliament, offices of the president, and governors in two of the four provinces.⁶¹

This arrangement could make life difficult for the new government, which needs to make tough decisions to steer the country out of the fiscal crisis facing the nation. The most challenging job facing the new government shall be to agree on critical fiscal tightening conditions under a new International Monetary Fund (IMF) program. The current IMF program expires in March.

Markets on February 21, 2024, reacted positively to the news of an alliance, which removed days of uncertainty. Pakistan's benchmark share index rose 1.81%. The index had fallen more than 5% since the February 8 national elections.

Pakistan bonds recovered after three straight days of falls. The December 2027 bond was the biggest gainer, rising 2.58 cents, closely followed by the April 2031 bond which rose 2.54 cents.

The combined seats of the PMLN and the PPP' make a simple majority in parliament to form a government, which, however, will also rope in smaller parties in the coalition.

Candidates backed by Imran Khan won 93 seats, but do not have the numbers to form a government. He and his party have rejected the results of the elections, alleging widespread rigging.⁶²

Today, the issue of election rigging is causing political tensions in the country. In an article entitled “ An Election Shatters the Image of Pakistan’s Mightiest Force” published in the New York Times, on February 21, 2024, said that “Pakistanis once thought of the military as the iron hand behind the country’s politics. That idea has been broken, threatening the establishment.”⁶³

The election is now definitely controversial because of the alleged widespread rigging. The US on February 20, 2024, reiterated that claims of interference in recent general elections in Pakistan should be investigated. The US Department of State spokesperson, Matthew Miller, said:⁶⁴

Any claims of interference or fraud should be fully and transparently investigated ...That’s a matter I leave for Pakistan but as I said when it comes to any claims of interference or allegations, we want to see those fully investigated....We always want to see Internet freedom around the world including the availability of platforms that people use to communicate with each other.

After the PMLN and the PPP announced to formation of a coalition government in the Centre, the PTI has warned of the ‘worst political instability’ ahead if the nation was forced to accept the “slavery of criminals.” The PTI said “We reject the entire drama of PDM 2.0 after gathering mandate pilferers. The nation gave the mandate to the PTI in the Centre, Punjab, and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), with a clear majority of 180 seats. The party will resist using all platforms against the theft of the public mandate. Decision-makers must give the majority party its due right to form its government.”⁶⁵

On February 21, 2024, the PMLN continued its efforts toward government formation by striking agreements with various coalition partners following a recent power-sharing accord with the PPP).

PMLN representatives engaged with delegations from the MQMP, BAP, and Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (JUI), solidifying their alliances and outlining plans for governance.

It was disclosed that the PMLN and MQMP have reached a consensus to collaborate within the government framework. The agreement underscores a commitment to foster reconciliation and cooperation, with a focus on enhancing political, democratic, and economic stability across the nation.

Central to their discussions was the imperative of ensuring equitable distribution of resources and powers, laying the groundwork for future deliberations on critical issues such as the protection of urban rights in Sindh, particularly in Karachi, and the restoration of the port city's economic prominence.⁶⁶

Meanwhile, the Sindh High Court (SHC) has ordered the restoration of all social media apps, including X (formerly Twitter) while hearing petitions against the shutdown of internet services on election day in the country.

A two-member bench, headed by Sindh High Court Chief Justice Aqeel Ahmad Abbasi, heard the petitions on February 21, 2024, expressing concern over the widespread shutdown of internet services during the crucial election period.

The government's fear of dissent forced it to take X as a threat and shut it down without giving any reasons.

It is not the only one, as other social media applications, cellular services, and the internet frequently face blackouts, leaving from the president to experts and media to the common person to question the unannounced disruption and dub it an attempt to silent dissent. The chief justice made sarcastic remarks directed at the public prosecutor, commenting on the alleged irregularities in the election process.⁶⁷

The proposed new government looks much the same as the shaky coalition that combined to oust Khan in a no-confidence vote in 2022 when Sharif became prime minister for the first time. The PTI has valid reasons to lash out against the PDM 2.0 government agreement and the reiteration of its accusations of foul play. The issue of election rigging is profoundly serious and is tearing the nation apart. Therefore, it must be examined thoroughly and rectified immediately, to the extent possible.

Today, the rigging issue is not going anywhere in the global media is carrying the stories. AFP in its article "Shehbaz Sharif: Pakistan's Compromise Candidate Prime Minister," published on March 3, 2024, maintained that:⁶⁸

The Sharif family's military-backed Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) party won the most seats in the election but fell short of an expected majority in a poll that was marred by allegations of pre-poll rigging and vote tampering. Khan's lawmakers won the most seats, despite a sweeping crackdown against his Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf party that forced its candidates to run as independents and blocked them from holding rallies.

...Sharif's first tenure was defined by a steep economic downturn and a campaign of defiance from popular Khan -- who was jailed and barred from office in the runup to polls. The premiership lasted less than a year and a half before he handed the reins to a caretaker government which ushered in elections last month. Unlike his elder brother -- whose relations with the country's powerful military and his opponents were strained -- Sharif was considered capable of compromising even with his enemies. Pakistan's military is the country's most powerful institution and has ruled the nation for nearly half its history -- and pulls the strings even when not governing.

Mohammed Hanif, in his article "Pakistan's 'King of Chaos' Imran Khan keeps winning even behind bars," published in the BBC dated March 3, 2024, said that:⁶⁹

Pakistan's recent elections were supposed to bring in a period of stability, desperately needed to deal with crippling inflation and bitter political divides in the country, writes author and journalist. Instead, they delivered a minority government - a shaky, reluctant coalition that looks unsure of its mandate.... The "establishment" - a euphemism used by local media for Pakistan's powerful military - has always believed that general elections are too sensitive an exercise to be left to civilian politicians.

This time around they opened their old election playbook and used every trick deployed successfully in the past. The main contender Imran Khan was put in jail. He faces more than 150 criminal and civil charges, all of which he denies. A week before the elections he was sentenced in three cases - in one he

was accused of contracting a marriage in a hurry. His party denied its election symbol and a united platform and was forced to contest as independents. Ex-PM Nawaz Sharif was widely seen as having the army's backing.

Many were evading police raids instead of campaigning in their constituencies. His main opponents were cleared of many cases against them and given a free hand to campaign. On election day social media and mobile phone services were shut down, apparently for security concerns but to ensure that Khan supporters did not have easy access to the polling booths and would find it hard to identify their candidates on the ballot paper. Khan's supporters showed remarkable ingenuity, formed WhatsApp groups, improvised apps and websites overnight reached polling booths, and managed to find their candidates. His party used AI-generated speeches to convey the message of their jailed leader. Imran Khan's prison ID number was turned into an election slogan. They campaigned guerrilla-style and sprang a surprise on election day.

Despite all the claims of rigging against it, his Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) still emerged as the single largest party in the election. The Khan wave on election day was too strong to be reined in by routine rigging. The establishment used 20th-century tactics to tame a digital-savvy generation - and lost. To the military's tried and tested machinations, the voters' response was polite and defiant: thank you, but no thank you, we are not as ignorant and illiterate as you think we are. We may not be able to take you on in the streets, you have your guns, but here is our stamp on the ballot. Do what you will with it.... Most Pakistani politicians have had to spend time in prison at some point. But no one seems to have had more fun than Imran Khan.

Denied every public platform to reach his supporters, he has pulled off an election victory from his prison cell with a communique sent through his lawyers and close family.

Last May, when Imran Khan was arrested for the first time after his government's dismissal, his supporters rioted, attacking army cantonments and other symbols of the army's power and prestige. A senior general's house was set on fire, and some rioters even managed to enter army headquarters. Protests broke out after Khan was arrested over corruption allegations. The crackdown that followed was swift and brutal.

Most of the PTI top leadership was abducted and pressured to part ways with Imran Khan - some condemned his politics, others quit politics for life.

The establishment wanted to send out a clear signal that Imran Khan and his party were finished. With Khan in jail, as the election drew closer, the party was taken over by second-tier leadership and local faithful who were crucial in organizing the battered party's campaign to victory. They were certain that their leader would not be allowed to return to power, but they showed through their vote that they wouldn't abandon him just because the army wanted them to....When his party lost the 2013 elections, he campaigned relentlessly to get the results overturned and laid siege to the capital Islamabad. He was able to do it with the establishment's backing. Now that he is the establishment's enemy number one, he is buoyant after his party's showing at the polls.

His party has decided to sit in opposition, but Imran Khan likes to play his politics not in parliament but out on the streets, with public rallies and social media. The current government is already being dubbed

as a "coalition of losers" - it is a coalition of parties that were soundly beaten by Khan in the elections. The election was marred by the suspension of mobile phone services.

Shaiq Hussain and Noack in their article”

“Lawmakers pick Pakistan’s leader, but Khan’s shadow looms from prison, The Washington Post”, March 3, 2024, [Pakistan parliament elects Shehbaz Sharif as prime minister - The Washington Post](#) maintained that:⁷⁰

Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), which appeared to have a commanding lead in unofficial polls released immediately after voting stations closed on Feb. 8.

Khan’s allies claim that Pakistani officials, shocked by the strong public support for the imprisoned ex-leader, slowed down vote counting and rigged the results — an accusation that the authorities have denied. But even among Khan’s opponents, the sentiment that fairness is lacking in Pakistani politics remains widespread..... Khan’s party was almost entirely dismantled after his supporters attacked military installations in the wake of his arrest on corruption charges in May. But subsequent convictions and prison terms in three trials did not break the ex-leader’s popularity and may even have bolstered it.

Nawaz Sharif is likely to retain a strong influence on his younger brother and the direction of Pakistan’s next government, as it seeks to find a response to public sympathy for Khan and his party’s appeal. The PTI’s savvy use of social media in recent months successfully circumvented efforts to undermine Khan’s populist pitches to voters, which largely revolve around disrupting the status quo of Pakistani politics and building a nationalistic European-style welfare state based on Islamic values.... One of the key questions is whether Pakistan’s establishment will allow Khan’s party to regain a seat at the table, potentially paving the way for Khan’s release and political comeback.

On the regional level, the PTI appears to have been given some space since the election. Officials did not prevent a Khan ally from being elected head of the government in Pakistan’s northern Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province, where his party dominated the elections. While Khan’s party still appears far from dominating on the national level, there are signs that last month’s vote has upended the status quo.

Vivek Katju in his article “Pakistan: With Shehbaz Sharif set to become PM, army will use every means to weaken Imran Khan”, argues that:⁷¹The army was once again seeking to reinforce the message that whatever may be the results of the election, the real protector of Pakistan is the army, and the father figure of the Pakistani people is its chief. The army needed to send out this signal, for it was not able to accomplish its objective of finishing off the former Prime Minister and the founder and leader of the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), Imran Khan, in the national elections. The army, from behind the scenes, ensured that the Pakistan Election Commission did not allow PTI candidates to contest elections either for the National Assembly or the Provincial Assembly using the party’s ‘cricket bat’ symbol. They could only contest as independents, which they did. To the surprise of many—and one can conjecture that of the generals too—Imran Khan’s independents did remarkably well. They came through as the largest group in the National Assembly and were able to win the majority in the Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (KP) Assembly.... The struggle between Munir and Imran Khan is not over. Munir will use every arrow in his quiver to weaken Imran Khan, but it will not be easy, for he has evoked the issue of ‘gairat’ —pride— which is so important in a quasi-feudal society as Pakistan continues to be. As for the new government,

its priority would be to put the economy back on the rails. That cannot be a simple job, especially because of Pakistan's continuing irrational animosity towards India. PML-N had been tipped to win this month's polls after securing the backing of the powerful military establishment. But jailed ex-prime minister Imran Khan delivered a surprise result at the polls, with candidates loyal to him securing more seats than any other party despite a crackdown that crippled their campaign.

Reuters, in its report "Pakistan's Shehbaz Sharif to take oath as prime minister for a second term today" published on March 3, 2024, says that:⁷²

"Pakistan went to the polls on Feb. 8 in a vote marred by a mobile internet shutdown on election day; arrests and violence in its build-up; and unusually delayed results, leading to accusations that the vote was rigged".

There was widespread well-deserved criticism of the ECP. An editorial entitled "democracy damaged" published in Dawn on February 28, 2024, said:⁷³

From its complicity in the failure to hold timely elections for the KP and Punjab assemblies to its role in delaying the general elections over a controversy-ridden census, from its failure to ensure a free, fair, and inclusive environment for electioneering to its flouting of myriad rules and laws governing the electoral process on election day and thereafter — the charge sheet against the ECP has not stopped growing. Have the country's laws not been trampled upon enough? Does the foundation of the 16th National Assembly also need to be laid on a violation of constitutional process? There were immense expectations attached to the democratic process over the past year, with millions hoping it would provide them with a pathway to deliverance from the many crises afflicting the country. Instead, the nation witnessed once again how casually constitutional schematics can be subverted when the powerful decide to rob the public of its voice. Meanwhile, the institution created and empowered to safeguard the country's democratic framework either stood by and watched it be mutilated or became complicit in its weakening through its disdain for the law. It must be asked: is there somewhere that the ECP and its backers intend to draw a line? Most of the Pakistan's population is young and impressionable. What they have seen over the past year cannot engender any hopes for a just and progressive society. Lasting damage has already been caused by the actions of a few. How long will they continue to be tolerated? PML-N had been tipped to win this month's polls after securing the backing of the powerful military establishment.

But jailed ex-prime minister Imran Khan delivered a surprise result at the polls, with candidates loyal to him securing more seats than any other party despite a crackdown that crippled their campaign.

Very recently, three Opposition parties - the Grand Democratic Alliance (GDA), Jamaat-i-Islami (JI), and Jamiat Ulema-i-Islam-Fazl (JUI-F) rejected the results of elections held in Pakistan on February 8 and demanded fresh polls, Pakistan-based Dawn reported. The three parties have warned that they will not remain silent and the protest against the alleged rigging will continue with more force and intensity.

The three parties, which have recently joined hands to protest against the "'manipulated and rigged' elections" announced the setting up of a committee to plan a 'protest campaign' A large number of workers of the three parties gathered outside the Karachi Press Club and held a protest in line a province-wide call for observing the 'black day,' according to Dawn report.

The opposition parties had given the call to observe the black day in protest of the police action to scatter their protest planned outside the Sindh Assembly on February 25 over alleged rigging in the elections held on February 8. Carrying placards and banners, the protesters shouted slogans against 'theft' of mandate. Some of the protesters even carried black flags.

Addressing the protesters, GDA's Secretary General Safdar Abbasi said that the people of Sindh will not accept dual-faced democracy with bogus results. He said that people had already rejected the politics of hatred and terror and stressed that those who had imposed criminal elements on the people of Karachi had done a disservice to Pakistan and the people of this country.

Abbasi said, "The Feb 8 elections were not the elections, they were an organized and planned robbery which can never be accepted and forgiven." He said that the polls conducted on February 8 have further deepened instability, according to Dawn's report.

He stated, "Instead of bringing stability and calm, these polls have further deepened instability. If they are accepted and not fixed, they will cause irreparable damage to the country. For the stability of the country, these elections should be declared null and void." Addressing the protest, JI leader Osama Razi said that the people would not extend the scope of the protest if the authorities did not amend the election results according to Form-45s. He stated that the entire country was paying the price for what happened on February 8 in the name of polls.

Osama Razi said the protest will continue till its logical conclusion. He requested the Supreme Court of Pakistan to take notice of the alleged rigging in polls. He said, "Those who are celebrating their fake victories are unable to face the public." Razi said, "Even the formation of the governments in the Centre and provinces has become a challenge for these mandate thieves. Every party which has won doesn't want to share the burden of the government because it knows that any coalition which is based on fake mandate is not going to survive." Meanwhile, Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) has decided to hold a protest on March 2 against the alleged rigging in the elections held on February 8, Pakistan-based Geo News reported. The party founded by Imran Khan announced that other political parties would also join them.

PTI Secretary General Omar Ayub, who is also the party's candidate for the prime minister's position, spoke about the "large scale" rigging in the elections. He made the remarks in a press conference after he met with PTI founder Imran Khan, Geo News reported.

Ayub said PTI will hold nationwide protests against "rigging" in elections alongside other political parties. He said, "Our seats were stolen with just a stroke of the pen. The people gave the mandate to the former PTI chair. The nation's mandate and our seats have been attacked." He said that PTI will hold protests in courts and assemblies. (ANI)⁷⁴

Aljazeera reported that Pakistan's February 8 elections were marred by widespread allegations of rigging and manipulation, with Khan's PTI alleging its mandate was stolen.

On election day, mobile networks across the country were closed, citing "security concerns," and days after the polls, access to X was also restricted in the country, a restriction that continues to date.

Before the elections, many journalists had maintained that they were asked to impose a near-blanket ban on covering the PTI's campaign.

Political analyst Benazir Shah said that rather than protecting the fundamental rights of journalists, the state “twists vague and broadly written laws” to silence independent and critical voices.⁷⁵

“No matter who is in power in Pakistan, journalists and the media continue to be viewed as ‘enemies of the state.’ What does change with each year though is the list of silent spectators from within the state, which increases, and now seems to include even those tasked to protect fundamental rights,” she said. Analyst and columnist Cyril Almeida also added that while social media is the last “relatively free space,” the state has been trying to create conditions that would lead to “further repression.” The sad truth is that there are no more than a handful of fundamentally democratic, principled voices left in Pakistan and [they are] isolated,” the analyst said.⁷⁶

Given, the crisis political and economic situation, Pakistan faces the daunting task of undertaking serious structural reforms. An earlier reform agenda remains unfulfilled as yet. Therefore, there is now an urgency to carry it through immediately. The future reform agenda of the second Sharif government should be the following:⁷⁷

The Civil Services Reform

An ambitious reform agenda must be forthcoming primarily meant to improve the performance of the civil bureaucracy and enhance the service delivery of the government. Given the dysfunctional nature of most public services in the country, there is an urgency to adopt a modernization agenda for ability building to deliver the required outcomes. It is important to adopt a comprehensive approach to the modernization task. The plan will be spearheaded by the Modernization Unit created for the Prime Minister's office. A detailed Action Plan will be devised for each state sector (such as education health, commerce, communications, and agriculture) both at the federal level and the provincial level. A very simplified transformation process would include three stages, namely:

Action Plan formulation

Sector Tasks and Implementation

Outcomes and Feedback mechanisms.

Initially, a preliminary examination of the environment and resource availability of each sector shall be undertaken at once. The environment includes an examination of both legal and political factors affecting the performance of the sector. The resource availability includes an examination of all fiscal constraints in the area. This is needed to get a general idea of the sector's requirements, priorities, and organizational structures of the state agencies or departments. A preliminary examination of the workforce and ability of these agencies or departments is needed. Such knowledge is needed to find out whether the state agencies or departments are performing effectively and efficiently. It will help in finding areas of performance that have become problematic, if any. Such scrutiny will supply a clearer picture of the sector needed for the formulation of a workable modernization plan.

Meanwhile, the Modernization Unit will conduct a simultaneous exercise to decide on qualitative and quantitative indicators to gauge the performance of the agencies and departments of the sector. The task must be completed in two months. After the examination of the first report is complete, a detailed strategy will be devised for each sector. Comprehensive action plans will be prepared in the third month.

The second phase includes the formulation of detailed individual and group tasks per the agreed action plans. The time for the implementation of the action plan can stretch from a year to three years, depending upon the strategy and sector. Therefore, action plans will be formulated in one, two, and three-year formats.

The third phase relates to the feedback on the outcomes of the Action Plans in the second phase. It supplies feedback to the Prime Minister on the success or failures of these plans. A separate Monitoring and Evaluation group will be created to follow a framework given in the Action Plan itself. It will include agreed-upon performance indicators and targets for each program. For example, performance indicators of the FBR may include, both quantitative and qualitative indicators, such as:

Quantitative

Number of registered taxpayers by year

Number of large taxpayers by year

Amount of tax collected and tax type by year.

Amount of taxes in arrears by year

Amount of taxes refunded by year.

Number of employees in different sections or regions by year

Qualitative

The public belief of the bureau's performance by year

Effectiveness of the employment of technology

Integrating various tax data sets in the bureau.

Employment of IT for individual income tax ability assessment.

Overall successful use of technology for enhancing the bureau's performance.

Overall, the assessment of corrupt practices hampers the performance of the bureau.

Assessment of organizational structure and weaknesses of the bureau.

The morale of employees and the self-image of the bureau over the years.

Reporting Mechanisms

An annual report will be prepared for each sector. The scrutiny of the departments or agencies will be conducted by a third party, preferably donor agencies. Required changes shall be incorporated next year in the action plans, as per the recommendations of these reports.

The Function of Task Forces

This is a three-tier design. Each sector will be assigned three task forces: federal, provincial, and district. They will be headed by the minister or district head. Each task force will manage the implementation of sector plans. The Task Force will supply oversight of the sector's process. Each Task Force will consist of fifteen members, which will include government officials and outside experts.

The primary function of the Task Force shall be to:

Approve the Action plan.

Oversee the implementation of the sector strategy.

Deliberate on policy issues that affect the implementation of the plan and approve remedial measures.

Review the strategic direction of the plan in detail after six months.

Undertake the annual review of the plan with the aid of third-party reviewers.

Review the feedback on the performance of the department or agency and approve the implementation of the recommendations.

Follow up on the implementation of recommendations if any.

Conduct oversight of the Provincial Task Force

Undertake joint resource mobilization.

The Provincial task forces are a duplication of the federal task force. The Provincial Task Force shall oversee the work of the next tier of the District Task Force.

The entire effort will be backed up by a think tank working for the Prime Minister's office.

The greatest urgency is to formulate a Digital-Pakistan strategy for a revamped and robust IT ministry, which is direly needed. The application of modern technology is essential to integrate the work of the entire government of Pakistan, both at the federal and provincial levels. An urgent effort needs to be made to modernize the state's IT infrastructure. The present structure is inadequate to meet the future requirements of the government of Pakistan. A reputable global company will be given a five-year contract for this purpose.

The successful planning and implementation efforts will yield dividends in two years, or so.

Social Sector Reforms

Pakistan must focus on the development of its social sectors. Given the devastating effect of the economy, exceedingly tough economic times lie ahead for Pakistan. Given the serious situation, the future government would be seriously challenged to at once expand the federal Income Support Program's direct money transfers to the poorest of the poor. The country has shown a significant decline in poverty, from 50.4 percent in 2005-06 to 24.3 percent in 2015-16, both at the regional and national levels. However, despite the significant decline in poverty, over fifty million people live in poverty, and more than seventy-five million people are deprived of basic needs such as health, education, and shelter. Furthermore, Pakistan suffers from extreme forms of social exclusion and significant infrastructure gaps.

Economic growth has not resulted in job creation at the rate necessary to accommodate the approximately 1.5 million people who enter the workforce every year in Pakistan.⁷⁸

Human capital indicators, namely education and health, show miserable progress as compared to the rest of the South Asian region. According to the World Bank report, 'World Development Report 2019: The Changing Nature of Work' in 2017, Pakistan's human capital index (HCI) was lower than the average for its region and income group. Pakistan ranked 134 India ranked 115, Bangladesh 106, and Sri Lanka 74 out of 157 countries. Pakistan has one of the lowest female labor force participation rates in the region.⁷⁹

Education poverty is remarkably high in Pakistan due to low education capital. Children in Pakistan can expect to complete 8.8 years of pre-primary, primary, and secondary school by age 18. However, when the years of schooling are adjusted for the quality of learning, it is only equivalent to 4.8 years: a learning gap of four years.⁸⁰

According to a Pakistan Education Statistics report, over 22.84 million children are still out of school (that's 44 percent of our total children). The report says that 70 percent of the children in Balochistan, 57 percent in Fata, and 52 percent in Sindh are out of school. The report has shown that 26 percent of primary schools are run by a single teacher while 18 percent of the schools consist of one classroom and 32 percent are run without electricity, 22 percent without toilets, 21 percent without boundary walls, and 22 percent without drinking water. While seven percent of the total primary schools in the country are without buildings. Public spending on education is only 2.2 percent of GDP in FY2017.⁸¹

An analogous situation can be seen in the health sector. The World Bank report shows that forty-five out of one hundred children are stunted, and so at the risk of cognitive and physical limitations that can last a lifetime. The ratio is remarkably high compared to other developing countries like India (38), Bangladesh (36), and Sri Lanka (17). Pakistan has shown slow progress on maternal mortality and child mortality rates over time. The maternal mortality ratio is exceedingly high compared with other countries in the region (178 per 100,000 live births) in 2015. Similarly, the infant mortality rate is extremely high in Pakistan (66 per 1,000 live births).⁸²

Apart from low investment in the health sector, rapid population growth is resulting in the inadequacy of healthcare facilities. This is reflected in estimates that show 957 persons against one doctor, and one dentist per 9,730 persons. The current ratio of population and availability of hospital beds works out to 1,580 persons per bed in 2017-18. Public spending on health was only 0.9 percent of GDP in FY2017.⁸³

There is a need to develop a comprehensive strategy to enhance education and health facilities both in terms of quality and quantity across Pakistan, especially in the backward areas like southern Punjab, interior Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Balochistan.

Apart from the provision of these facilities, the government should develop a monitoring mechanism to track the progress and service delivery of these facilities.

Reducing Federal Expenditures

Today, it is essential to immediately cut the federal government's wasteful state expenditures. The nation expects quick actions on that score. It would be prudent to continue to cut many federal outlays, including defense, and thereby help the poorest of the poor in the country. The Sharif coalition government should make health and education sectors the highest priority state expenditures. Given scarce resources, the Sharif coalition government must cut defense expenditures, as the real threats faced by the country are mostly internal, not external. It must also nationalize the military's corporate interests in Pakistan. The country's military takes part in business activities like in Egypt, Thailand, and Indonesia. In principle, the military must not be involved in running businesses at all. Rapid urbanization and overall residential growth are ruining Pakistan's historical architectural legacy. The Sharif coalition government must preserve the classical national heritage of historic buildings and monuments while it can. Time to act now before it is too late. A national conservation policy is desperately needed. The Sharif coalition government needs to stop the massive corruption rampant in the private education sector. Excessive fees at the school level are a national issue. Diploma mills in the higher education sector have lowered standards of education to the bare minimum. Rote learning is a national curse. There is a housing crisis in Pakistan. Therefore, a massive house-building scheme be launched through a public-private business model. An overall plan be prepared by hiring international consultants experienced in the field.

New cities need to be built to ease the immense pressure. The Sharif coalition government must start a crusade against land-grabbers or the "qabza" mafia in Pakistan. The worth of these land grabs would be in trillions not billions, mind you. The people will cooperate in finding these land grabs. Swift action will yield hundreds of billions of rupees. Such crime spread today. Today, an unprecedented accountability drive being is being seen in Pakistan. Elevated levels of corruption in the past decades have eroded not only the state structures but also the social fabric of the nation. Commendable drive by the Supreme Court and the National Accountability Bureau.

Mainstreaming of erstwhile jihadist elements be conducted on a priority basis in collaboration with the military. A special task force has been set up for this purpose.

There is a need to galvanize the public for a new era of austerity, challenging work, discipline, and sacrifice. In the future, Pakistan's government must focus on reviving a faltering economy. It will face a balance of payments crisis and will have to seek its IMF bailout, once again. The government will have to act fast to shore up the country's shaky economy and end a years-long chronic energy crisis that has crippled industry. Decades of corruption and bad governance by the rulers of Pakistan have severely eroded Pakistan from within. The Sharif coalition government is desperately trying to reverse the trend. It needs time to stem the rot it has inherited. Therefore, it needs to adopt a rapprochement policy with neighbors. In the past, governments had been discredited and did not have much credibility left. Most importantly, the country's political parties are also discredited because of their actions, the bureaucracy demoralized because of bad governance, and the society itself badly divided on sectarian, linguistic, and ethnic social cleavages. Pakistan was now certainly a mess. The country was now among the list of top ten failed states in the world. This was ironic because Pakistan also happened to be one of the strongest military powers in the world. Pakistan's military strength cannot prevent an implosion of sorts like what happened with the Soviet Union in the late 1980s. The country was now dangerously isolated. It is only

China, Turkey, and Malaysia that have shown some support. The people are feeling hapless and disillusioned as never before. The country is in a mess, with no positive aspect on the horizon. The only good thing happening in Pakistan was the rising awareness thanks to the Information Revolution and the expanded media. This awareness needs to be channeled into a political force of some reckoning. Meanwhile, most political parties have lost their steam and suffered from poor and visionless leadership.

The Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) should take the requisite steps to ensure transparency in the Senate elections, considering the Supreme Court's decision. The citizens of Pakistan want an end to so-called horse trading or corrupt practices in Senate elections. Many have alleged that senate seats had been bought by political parties, namely the PPP and PMLN. The fact of vote buying and military manipulation in the Senate elections is well-known and uncontested by all independent observers of Pakistan politics. The question is whether it can be curtailed through reform of the election system. Open balloting is one such reform measure agreed upon by very many experts in Pakistani politics.

Pakistan must focus on the development of its human resources, sustainable economy, and the eradication of poverty which can only happen if bold policy decisions are taken now. The Sharif government can only fail at its peril. The people hoped for change, and it is now time to deliver. The Sharif government came into power on April 11, 2022. It is imperative to set the right direction at the beginning of the 16 months remaining term. There is still hope in Pakistan. The priority of the Sharif coalition government should be the following:⁸⁴

The South Punjab promises to be conducted at once. Earlier, on March 25, 2022, the PTI-led government sponsored a bill in the National Assembly seeking the creation of the south Punjab province. Foreign Minister Shah Mehmood Qureshi had given the constitutional amendment bill to the National Assembly seeking to split Punjab into two provinces. South Punjab would be constituted of Multan, Dera Ghazi Khan, and Bahawalpur divisions. Under the draft bill, the south Punjab province would have fifty-six seats in the National Assembly and 119 in its provincial assembly. The creation of the south Punjab province had the support of both the PML and the PPP.⁸⁵ A steering committee must be set up to establish the new province. However, the issue has been related to the back burner for political reasons.

Later, Pakistan must be divided into at least ten provinces. Punjab is divided into three: central, north, and south. Sindh into two: north and south.

Formation of a think tank to conduct research and guide the Government using the Next Steps approach and acting as a consultancy. Form a steering committee of experienced professionals in various areas to guide the government on various issues. These groups will manage the actualization of public policy in various areas.

A Modernization Unit to be set up in the office of the prime minister be tasked to formulate Key Performance Indicators and metrics for all public sector agencies and departments. A Key Performance Indicator (KPI) is a quantifiable value that decides how effectively an organization is reaching key goals. The KPIs are employed by organizations to calculate their success at achieving the established targets. The federal government is combined into a smaller and more effective administration. Some public agencies are bloated and need to be cut. Some departments may need to be merged or even dismantled. A review be held for this purpose.

A Task Force be set up to restructure vital public enterprises like WAPDA, PIA, Steel Mills, NHA, and Railways. A restructuring exercise be conducted to improve efficiency in collaboration with the Modernization Unit in the Prime Minister's office.

A detailed reform plan is being prepared for the education sector. Technical schools be set up in the pattern of Germany, preferably with the help of the German government. The purpose is to impart skills to youth not able to get a regular college education. Free quality public education, along with free health services, is envisaged in the concept of an Islamic welfare state. Free education like free health services will be a costly endeavor. Therefore, distribute 5% of GNP to the education sector, as recommended by UNESCO.

Close the fraudulent paper mills in the private higher education sector where rampant corrupt practices exist. Higher education may not be employed to make quick and easy money anymore.

Revival of the Musharraf era Local Government System, as it showed promise. Despite shortcomings, some important developments did take place in this area and there were some success stories at the local level.

The national crusade against the "Cabeza" mafia and encroaches must be conducted. This is an endemic problem in Pakistan and has grown in the last decade. Not just private space but also public space is threatened. That is most unfortunate. Public space is a sacred trust.

The PTI national curriculum agenda be advanced with input from all stakeholders. It must be flexible though to incorporate regional diversity. A framework would be formulated with a common core for the entire nation (1/3) and then a regional section to be the responsibility of the provinces (2/3). The purpose is to create national unity and cohesion. The framework will set up the teaching units in terms of syllabi, timetables, modules for class instruction, total study period, and testing.

There was a mushrooming growth of housing societies in the past decade or so. Most of these are frauds and people have lost billions of hard-earned savings. The State must come to the rescue of the public and take these swindlers to task. It must then simply nationalize these societies and put them under the control of various state authorities. Nationalization would be considered the last resort since it would require an act of parliament.

A National Health Service on the pattern of the UK. The founding principle shall be that the service be comprehensive, universal, and free at the point of delivery. However, patients would be required to pay prescription charges with a range of exemptions for the poorest of the poor. This is a costly endeavor and will require immense allocations of budgeted money. This measure, along with health, is one of the fundamental aims of the Islamic welfare system. Therefore, 5% of GNP to the health services sector.

Privatization of Public Sector Enterprises is postponed for at least a year. Focus on improving the performance of these enterprises instead. Giving enough autonomy and removal of needless political interventions is the key to the success of this effort.

Merge all department and services housing authorities like Police, Parliament, and Defense, into a single Federal Employees Housing Authority. Announce entitlement of all employees for housing as a priority.

The focus is on the performance of police services. Depoliticize them at once, especially in Punjab and Sindh. Employ technology to improve police efficiency. A detailed plan is needed to revamp the police

services and stop political interference at once. The public has a low opinion of the police service except for KP. Establish a task force for Improving Police Services with input from capable retired police officials and foreign experts.

The parliament's performance is poor and needs to be improved. The oversight function of the parliament is inadequate, at best. There is nothing more political than passing the budget as it deals with the allocation of scarce resources. Therefore, present the budget at least three months in advance of its passage date. The budget be discussed on the floor of the National Assembly in the first reading and then sent to Select Committees to be debated in detail with department heads, outside experts, and witnesses. The budget be agreed upon within these committees along with recommendations. The budget then was again debated on the floor of the house and eventually passed. Establish a separate television Parliament Channel within PTV to broadcast live the workings of the parliament. The purpose is to improve the quality of deliberations in the legislature.

Revamp civil services as a priority. Give tenure protection of postings for at least three years. Stop the shuffle dupe of endless postings as it causes service inefficiency and disruption.

Increase the retirement age of the employees to sixty-five.

Give life tenure to the higher judiciary so that the judges can concentrate on their jobs.

Focus on employing technology in governance (electronic governance measures) can improve the effectiveness of not only all public services but also the Legislature and Judiciary.

The federal government must take over the funds earlier collected to construct the Diamer Bhasha and Mohmand dams from the justice committee established by Justice Saqib Nisar, the earlier Chief Justice Pakistan. Mobilize the public within the country and the global diaspora community for donations. Meanwhile, build much smaller dams at once on the Indus River system.

Plan to build new cities to decrease the pressure of rural-to-urban migration on the big urban areas.

Have comprehensive expert plans made or revised for better land management of all urban areas.

Land records are in digital format in a single land authority.

Initiate an austerity drive in the federal and provincial governments at once. Cut the budget of these government outlays, including defense.

Reduce the mammoth size of the current Cabinet which has some 80 ministers to half immediately.

Revise the inter-governmental arrangements in education and health sectors after the 18th Amendment, to formulate a uniform policy.

Azad Kashmir and Gilgit Baltistan were set up as Pakistan's new provinces by amending the constitution.

Pakistan has no choice but to revamp the FBR on a priority basis. Also, improve governance issues to increase the pitiable exports. Distressed economic conditions require bold actions. Focus on stabilizing the economy on a priority basis.

End corrupt practices in the economic sector. For example, the Benaami property like done recently in India. Attach these properties to the state authorities. Expand the services of the Ehsaas program at

once and ensure prompt delivery of income support to the poorest of the poor. Reduction of national holidays Standardization of weights, measures, and the like. For example, stop using “Aruba,” “crores” and “lakhs” and use only millions, and billions, and discard the use of “maunds” only kilograms are allowed.

A detailed Plan of Action is to be prepared within a month to strengthen key institutions like State Bank, FBR, AGP, NACTA, IB, FIA, NAB, and FPSC.

Initiate social, cultural, and educational activities like those done by the BJP’s Sangh Parivar group in India. Some activities can be arranged in collaboration with effective NGOs working in the field already. For example, a Razakar Force for young men and women trained in martial arts; monsoon tree plantation campaigns in collaboration with agriculture departments, adult literacy centers, libraries, and urban clean-up campaigns using volunteers.

The World Bank’s Reform Agenda

The World Bank (WB) in its report ‘Enabling a Modern and Efficient Tax System’ said Pakistan needs to unify its tax system to increase its revenue potential. It also set out some immediate and long-term recommendations to improve its tax base, with special emphasis on the tobacco sector and the country’s powerful elite.

Despite the development of strategies and proclaimed intentions over the last two decades, successful outcomes remain to be attained, says the Bank.

Instead of a complete system overhaul, which may be infeasible from a political economy perspective, a carefully prioritized approach that bundles reforms with compensation mechanisms, stakeholder consultations, and continued investments in taxpayer services may be more promising. In the long run, reforms should aim to create (i) a simple CIT regime with a single, simplified provision for smaller companies, (ii) a personal income tax system focused on taxing income only at the source, and (iii) a non-distortionary comprehensive sales tax system.⁸⁶

The report notes that Pakistan’s current tax system provides preferential treatment to a range of economic and political interest groups through concessions, exemptions, and other policy measures.

It says meaningful reform, and therefore growth, is contingent on a country’s elites’ acceptance that growth is in their self-interest. For Pakistan, this requires highlighting to the elites that currently oppose tax reform that the costs associated with Pakistan’s boom-bust growth cycle outweigh their benefits from narrow preferential tax treatment, and that they (and their businesses) are set to gain more from a stable and fast-growing Pakistan with an equitable and efficient tax system than under the status quo.

Public pressure on elites through transparency can also help, for instance through the publication of detailed beneficiary reports that highlight which firms and beneficiary owners take advantage of certain tax incentives.⁸⁷

Sales Tax

The bank urges unifying the rate structure and eliminating zero ratings on domestically sold products as soon as possible. As a medium-term priority, the report suggests the reduction of sales tax exemptions while concurrently lowering the overall rate.

In the long term, WB recommends unifying and aligning the sales tax registration threshold with the CIT threshold and harmonizing the provincial and federal sales tax systems.⁸⁸

Personal Income Tax

As an immediate priority, the report urges unifying and simplifying the personal income tax schedule for salaried and non-salaried taxpayers. Second, the bank suggests reducing the time dependence on capital gain tax liability.

In the long term, WB recommends calibrating the taxation of capital and labor income. Pakistan could consider establishing a dual-income tax regime that only differentiates income by two sources: labor and capital. A distinction between these two sources adequately considers that capital should be taxed for redistributive purposes, but that lower taxation than for labor income can encourage savings and investments.⁸⁹

Corporate Income Tax

The bank urges:

Creating a unified and simplified concessional tax regime for small companies (immediate priority)

Unifying the standard rate regime, expanding thin-cap provisions, and rationalizing tax incentives (medium-term priority)

Resolving inconsistencies between the turnover and alternative tax regimes (long-term priority)

FED on Cigarettes

The bank suggests creating an automated mechanism to adjust excise rates for inflation. Pakistan taxes cigarettes through nominal specific rates, but inflation risks eroding the tax base over time when nominal taxes are not adjusted upwards. To safeguard against inflation-induced tax base erosion, Pakistan could consider introducing an annual automatic adjustment mechanism that updates cigarette tax rates in line with inflation.

In the medium term, Pakistan should roll out an effective digitized stamp system to allow for uniform enforcement of excise duty. WB said Pakistan could consider adopting QR codes that link directly to a verifiable database within the Federal Board of Revenue.

Finally, in the long term, the report recommends unifying the tax system to increase its revenue potential. Pakistan's system of dual taxation for cigarettes based on their final retail price opens evasion opportunities and differs from international practice. Pakistan could consider applying a single rate to all cigarettes independent of their price. This would not only raise revenue but would also align the taxation of cigarettes with the WHO's recommended practice.⁹⁰

Pakistan must focus on the development of its human resources, sustainable economy, and the eradication of poverty which can only happen if bold policy decisions are taken now. The Sharif government can only fail at its peril. The people hoped for change, and it is now time to deliver. The Sharif government came into power on April 11, 2022. It is imperative to set the right direction at the beginning of the 16 months remaining term. There is still hope in Pakistan. The priority of the Sharif coalition government should be the following:⁹¹

The South Punjab promises to be conducted at once. On March 25, 2022, the PTI-led government sponsored a bill in the National Assembly seeking the creation of the south Punjab province. Foreign Minister Shah Mehmood Qureshi had given the constitutional amendment bill to the National Assembly seeking to split Punjab into two provinces. South Punjab would be constituted of Multan, Dera Ghazi Khan, and Bahawalpur divisions. Under the draft bill, the south Punjab province would have fifty-six seats in the National Assembly and 119 in its provincial assembly. The creation of the south Punjab province had the support of both the PML and the PPP.⁹² A Task Force be set up for this purpose.

Later, Pakistan must be divided into at least ten provinces. Punjab is divided into three: central, north, and south. Sindh into two: north and south.

Formation of a think tank to conduct research and guide the Government using the Next Steps approach and acting as a consultancy. Form a steering committee of experienced professionals in various areas to guide the government on various issues. These groups will manage the actualization of public policy in various areas.

A Modernization Unit to be set up in the office of the prime minister be tasked to formulate Key Performance Indicators and metrics for all public sector agencies and departments. A Key Performance Indicator (KPI) is a quantifiable value that decides how effectively an organization is reaching key goals. The KPIs are employed by organizations to calculate their success at achieving the established targets. The federal government is combined into a smaller and more effective administration. Some public agencies are bloated and need to be cut. Some departments may need to be merged or even dismantled. A review be held for this purpose.

A Task Force be set up to restructure vital public enterprises like WAPDA, PIA, Steel Mills, NHA, and Railways. A restructuring exercise be conducted to improve efficiency in collaboration with the Modernization Unit in the Prime Minister's office.

A detailed reform plan is being prepared for the education sector. Technical schools be set up in the pattern of Germany, preferably with the help of the German government. The purpose is to impart skills to youth not able to get a regular college education. Free quality public education, along with free health services, is envisaged in the concept of an Islamic welfare state. Free education like free health services will be a costly endeavor. Therefore, distribute 5% of GNP to the education sector, as recommended by UNESCO. End the paper mills in the private higher education sector where rampant corrupt practices exist. Higher education may not be employed to make quick and easy money anymore.

Revival of the Musharraf era Local Government System, as it showed promise. Despite shortcomings, some important developments did take place in this area and there were some success stories at the local level.

A national crusade against the "qabza" mafia and encroaches must be conducted. This is an endemic problem in Pakistan and has grown in the last decade. Not just private space but also public space is threatened. That is most unfortunate. Public space is a sacred trust.

The PTI national curriculum agenda be advanced with input from all stakeholders. It must be flexible though to incorporate regional diversity. A framework would be formulated with a common core for the

entire nation (1/3) and then a regional section to be the responsibility of the provinces (2/3). The purpose is to create national unity and cohesion. The framework will set up the teaching units in terms of syllabi, timetables, modules for class instruction, total study period, and testing.

There was a mushrooming growth of housing societies in the past decade or so. Most of these are frauds and people have lost billions of hard-earned savings. The State must come to the rescue of the public and take these swindlers to task. It must then simply nationalize these societies and put them under the control of various state authorities. Nationalization would be considered the last resort since it would require an act of parliament.

A National Health Service on the pattern of the UK. The founding principle shall be that the service be comprehensive, universal, and free at the point of delivery. However, patients would be required to pay prescription charges with a range of exemptions for the poorest of the poor. This is a costly endeavor and will require immense allocations of budgeted money. This measure, along with health, is one of the fundamental aims of the Islamic welfare system. Therefore, 5% of GNP to the health services sector.

Privatization of Public Sector Enterprises is postponed for at least a year. Focus on improving the performance of these enterprises instead. Giving enough autonomy and removal of needless political interventions is the key to the success of this effort.

Merge all department and services housing authorities like Police, Parliament, and Defense, into a single Federal Employees Housing Authority. Announce entitlement of all employees for housing as a priority.

The focus of the performance of police services. Depoliticize them at once, especially in Punjab and Sindh. Employ technology to improve police efficiency. A detailed plan is needed to revamp the police services and stop political interference at once. The public has a low opinion of the police service except for KP. Establish a task force for Improving Police Services with input from capable retired police officials and foreign experts.

The parliament's performance is poor and needs to be improved. The oversight function of the parliament is inadequate, at best. There is nothing more political than passing the budget as it deals with the allocation of scarce resources. Therefore, present the budget at least three months in advance of its passage date. The budget be discussed on the floor of the National Assembly in the first reading and then sent to Select Committees to be debated in detail with department heads, outside experts, and witnesses. The budget be agreed upon within these committees along with recommendations. The budget then was again debated on the floor of the house and eventually passed. Establish a separate television Parliament Channel within PTV to broadcast live the workings of the parliament. The purpose is to improve the quality of deliberations in the legislature.

Revamp civil services as a priority. Give tenure protection of postings for at least three years. Stop the shuffle dupe of endless postings as it causes service inefficiency and disruption.

Increase the retirement age of the employees to sixty-five.

Give life tenure to the higher judiciary so that the judges can concentrate on their jobs.

Focus on employing technology in governance (electronic governance measures) can improve the effectiveness of not only all public services but also the Legislature and Judiciary.

Take over the funds to construct the Diamer Bhasha and Mohmand dams from Chief Justice Pakistan at once. Mobilize the public within the country and the global diaspora community for donations. Meanwhile, build much smaller dams at once on the Indus River system.

Plan to build new cities to decrease the pressure of rural-to-urban migration on the big urban areas.

Have comprehensive expert plans made or revised for better land management of all urban areas.

Land records are in digital format in a single land authority.

Initiate an austerity drive in the federal and provincial governments at once. Cut the budget of these government outlays, including defense.

Revise the inter-governmental arrangements in education and health sectors after the 18th Amendment, to formulate a uniform policy.

Azad Kashmir and Gilgit Baltistan were set up as Pakistan's new provinces by amending the constitution. Pakistan has no choice but to revamp the FBR on a priority basis. Also, improve governance issues to increase the pitiable exports. Distressed economic conditions require bold actions. Focus on stabilizing the economy on a priority basis.

End corrupt practices in the economic sector. For example, the Benaami property like done recently in India. Attach these properties to the state authorities. Expand the services of the Ehsaas program at once and ensure prompt delivery of income support to the poorest of the poor. Reduction of national holidays Standardization of weights, measures, and the like. For example, stop using "arubs," "crores" and "lakhs" and use only millions, and billions, and discard the use of "maunds" only kilograms are allowed.

A detailed Plan of Action is to be prepared within a month to strengthen key institutions like State Bank, FBR, AGP, NACTA, IB, FIA, NAB, and FPSC.

Initiate social, cultural, and educational activities like those done by the BJP's Sangh Parivar group in India. Some activities can be arranged in collaboration with effective NGOs working in the field already. For example, a Razakar Force for young men and women trained in martial arts; monsoon tree plantation campaigns in collaboration with agriculture departments, adult literacy centers, libraries, and urban clean-up campaigns using volunteers.

By early August 2021, the PTI government had approved the following set of reforms:93

Reorganize the Federal Government and ease the burden on the exchequer by reducing the number of organizational entities from 441 to 307.

Restructure and Reform the top ten loss-making State-Owned Enterprises such as PIA, Railways, Pakistan Steel Mills, and key Institutions of governance such as FBR, Auditor General, and SECP. The inefficient governance system cannot be tolerated anymore.: The Ministry of Finance's data on the 10 largest public sector corporations shows that there is one manager (BS17-22) per 2.26, 2.59, 2.66, 121, and 48 staff (BS1-16) in PIA, OGDC, Pakistan Steel Mills, Utility Stores Corporation and Pakistan Ordnance Factories, respectively. Today, there are over 212 state-owned enterprises, with 84 commercial organizations and 83 subsidiaries of commercials. All are posting cumulative financial losses of hundreds of billions of

rupees every year. 94 It is not the job of the government to run commercial enterprises. For years, Pakistan has not even been able to privatize the much-talked-about Pakistan Steel Mills and PIA.

Why has the size of federal ministries, departments, and bureaucracy kept on rising, when, after the 18th Amendment, the key subjects were delegated to the provinces? It is high time that the Pakistan government gets serious about civil services reforms.

Public Finance Management Law under which the powers of the Ministry of Finance have been delegated to the line ministries and the introduction of E-Office Suite in the Federal Ministries to improve efficiency and transparency.

The Civil Service was to be reformed. Prime Minister Imran Khan on September 22, 2021, terming good governance the key to the success of a government, urged his cabinet members to stay focused on achieving the targets and make the political party stronger through performance delivery. "We are ensuring that during our tenure, all the promises are met, and all services delivered to the citizens," he said in his address at the signing of two-year Performance Agreements 2021-23 with federal ministers. 95The signing was part of the prime minister's comprehensive Civil Service Reforms Agenda, under which the government had initiated a management system that brought the entire federal government together through a single implementation tool of 'Performance Agreements.' The prime minister said the high-performance delivery in the next two years would make a smooth way ahead for the government to succeed in general polls. Imran Khan asked the heads of ministries to achieve performance goals by setting high aspirations and evaluating their highs and lows. He expressed confidence that his team would continue to work at full throttle. He mentioned that the "biggest challenge" was the persistent fight with several mafias that wanted a status quo for their vested interests. 96Special Assistant to PM on Establishment Shehzad Arbab said a total of forty-one ministries had prepared 1,100 initiatives for the next two years. Of these, 426 initiatives will be completed by June 2022 and 488 by June 2023 while 176 running initiatives will supplement the overall delivery of ministries for the next two years and beyond. 97He said the Performance Agreements had been finalized after a rigorous process of review and evaluation. He further said the exercise not only allowed the government to implement its agenda more effectively but also helped the ministers and secretaries to track progress within their divisions and objectively assess the performance of their officers. Under the Performance Agreements, all ministries have prepared work plans with a set of initiatives and quarterly targets to be achieved over the next two years. These work plans have been reviewed by the Peer Review Committee (comprising senior officials of cross-sectoral ministries) for improvement, besides the feedback incorporated by the ministries before submission to the PM Office. 98The process of quarterly performance review will enable the prime minister to keep track of his government's performance. This system will not only help all ministries set their annual work plans but also create space to embed the reform agenda into the government's system. The targets collectively reviewed quarterly through a digitized platform, will play a key role in identifying bottlenecks and addressing cross-ministerial coordination challenges.99 An open transparent selection process for appointment of CEOs/MDs of Public Sector Organizations based purely on merit sixty-two such appointments have been made under this process and several Overseas Pakistanis have been selected. A Cabinet Committee on Institutional Reforms (CCIR) has been established to review and monitor the implementation of these reforms.

However, the implementation of the reform agenda was stuck in bureaucratic red tape and the loss of political will. Thus, the PTI government had failed to implement its reform agenda. Ishrat Hussain had been a federal minister in the PTI-led government but had resigned out of frustration. Ansar Abbasi, in his article “Failure to implement approved reforms frustrated Ishrat Hussain” published in The News, on July 31, 2021 while publicly complaining stated that:¹⁰⁰

However, in most cases, the line ministries are dilly-dallying over the implementation of these reforms. ...significant work on reforms, despite having been approved by the cabinet, faces implementation challenges because of a lack of political will among those enjoying executive authority.... a comprehensive set of reforms after a detailed consultative process and ...approved by the cabinet, the implementation of the reforms remained elusive.... the issue of the bureaucracy’s politicization, particularly in Punjab, as it had seriously hurt performance and service delivery. ...the situation remained unchanged. The politicization of the civil bureaucracy continues apace and in the case of Punjab has deteriorated and reached such a level that officers are changed frequently without any respect to tenure. As against the normal tenure of three years, officers in Punjab are changed in weeks and months.

Much earlier, then Prime Minister Imran again said on July 30, 2021, that reforms were underway to improve the tax system, adding that consultation with stakeholders would help accelerate the process.¹⁰¹

The Accountability Issue and National Accountability Commission (NAB)

Much earlier, on May 24, 2021, Prime Minister Imran Khan claimed that in the last three years’ tenure of PTI, the NAB had recovered 484 billion rupees in contrast to only 290 billion rupees recovered from 1999 to 2017. He said when a government does not protect the criminals and lets investigation agencies and accountability work without interference; it shows in the results being achieved.¹⁰²

Having failed to evolve a consensus on devising a new accountability mechanism, opposition parties have initiated the discussion with renewed vigor. Most political parties in the country are in favor of introducing amendments to the NAB law. Nevertheless, in the last ten years of democratic governance, these parties have been unable to produce mutually agreed changes and let the status quo prevail. The PPP-led coalition government tried to repeal the NAB law in 2009 and later in 2013-14. Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PMLN) did not cooperate each time.

The PPP government claimed in 2009 that the proposed amendments were not only meant to revise the NAB law introduced by former dictator General Pervez Musharraf under the National Accountability Ordinance (NAO) 1999 but also to fulfill the demands of Charter of Democracy (COD). COD was signed by former Prime Ministers: Benazir Bhutto and Mian Nawaz Sharif in London on May 14, 2006.

The charter states, “Truth and Reconciliation Commission be established to replace politically motivated NAB with an independent accountability commission, whose chair shall be nominated by the prime minister in consultation with the leader of the Opposition and confirmed by a joint parliamentary committee with 50 percent members from treasury benches and remaining 50 percent from the opposition parties. The bill about the NAB law was referred to the Committee of Law and Justice in 2009 headed by PPP MNA Begum Nasim Chaudhry. Twenty-eight consultations of the committee were held but failed to attain a consensus.

The PPP always wanted to revise the NAB law because it argues that General Pervez Musharraf used it for witch-hunting and that it could be maneuvered by any government. The PPP believes that the NAB law is irrational; there is a combination of use and abuse of the law which must be amended to stop exploitation. In the past, the PMLN did not cooperate thinking that the PPP wanted benefits for itself, as per PPP claims.

Much earlier, in 2016, the PMLN government started a debate to amend the NAB law. A parliamentary committee was formed to produce suggested amendments. PMLN and PPP agreed to form a National Accountability Commission to replace NAB. Both parties agreed on fifty-three out of fifty-five clauses for the formation of the new commission. However, the parliamentary committee could not formulate the final draft because PTI and Jamaat-e-Islami (JI) did not agree with the suggested clauses aside. He thinks the amendments PMLN wanted to introduce were not transparent. "JI does consider that NAB law needs to be transparent. NAB must not be used to insult people and should not be allowed to detain anyone until they are proven guilty."

In the last few years, two provincial governments have tried to introduce their anti-corruption law and justified it under the 18th Amendment which allows provinces to make special anti-corruption laws. The PTI government in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa introduced the Ehtesab Commission law under the Ehtesab (KPEC) Act 2014. In 2015, the Peshawar High Court (PHC) dismissed fifteen petitions filed against the KPEC Act and declared it a valid piece of legislation. However, the current PTI government in KPK has decided to disband the Ehtesab Commission by showing discontentment with its performance. In 2017, the Sindh government introduced the "Sindh Anti-Corruption Agency Act." However, in August 2017, the Sindh High Court (SHC) struck down the law.

At the time of former Prime Minister Mian Nawaz Sharif's conviction by the accountability court, PTI chair, Imran Khan, termed the act a "historical decision" but expressed a lack of trust in NAB after an accountability court acquitted former president Asif Ali Zardari in a corruption case in August 2017; the last of twelve corruption cases filed against him. On August 29, 2018, Prime Minister Imran Khan expressed satisfaction with NAB's performance, a change from his prior views, while meeting with Chairman Justice (r) Javed Iqbal. He also pledged to assure his government's full support to NAB to eradicate corruption and promote transparency. The PTI's federal and provincial ministers had applauded the earlier arrest of the Opposition leader in the National Assembly and the president of PMLN, Mian Shahbaz Sharif in Ashiyana Iqbal housing fraud. Besides, they hoped that the NAB would not hesitate in arresting more people.¹⁰³

The PTI government then constituted a committee under Federal Minister of Law & Justice, Farogh Naseem to revise the existing legal framework of NAB. The committee had asked NAB, the Ministry of Law, the Interior Ministry, and other concerned departments to give their suggestions. As of October 2020, NAB reform plans have been bogged down in the country's vicious party politics and schisms.

Paradoxically, both the PTI and the Opposition PDM had termed the much-anticipated March 1, 2021, judgment of the Supreme Court in presidential reference seeking open ballot voting in the upcoming Senate Elections, as a historic win.' Several PTI leaders said that the apex court judgment was in their favor. Meanwhile, on March 1, 2021, Vice President PMLN Maryam Nawaz, among others, also alluded to victory for the Opposition. She remarked that the Constitution is supreme and is greater than any 'nefarious design.' Later, the powers of the NAB were restricted somewhat. Given the notoriety of the NAB, it is best to be closed down as such.

The Senate must be elected through open balloting as the process is more transparent. Previously, under the Supreme Court's judgment, the Senate elections would be held as per Article 226 of the constitution under secret ballot. The apex court has directed the Election Commission of Pakistan to use the latest technology and take the necessary steps to ensure transparency in the polls. The court has also ruled the Election Commission of Pakistan is empowered to take all measures to curb corrupt practices under Article 218(3), and that the secrecy of the ballot is not absolute, meaning that it can be changed through a future constitutional amendment.

Today, the country faces serious political, economic, and security challenges with no easy solution in sight. The new Sharif government will have to face these challenges head-on to avert political chaos and anarchy in the country.

Pakistan continues to suffer from an ineffective and inefficient bureaucracy and most importantly a political will to see a comprehensive agenda of reforms through to competition. Notwithstanding its pious declarations, the second Sharif government simply did not have either the will or the capacity to implement the reform agenda. However, a comprehensive reform agenda is the rallying cry of the times without which Pakistan cannot get out of the serious mess in which it is stuck today.

The new Sharif government is a déjà vu of earlier failed democratic experiments by the Pakistan military. From a hybrid democratic system, Pakistan has descended to an authoritarian system of governance much like the Central Asian republics and the many Mukhbara states in the Middle East. There is little hope for a transformation of Pakistan from an authoritarian system towards even a semblance of democracy.

Dr. Sohail Mahmood is an Independent Political Analyst based in Chapel Hill NC

¹ "Shehbaz Sharif set to become Pakistan's Prime Minister for a second time", *PTI*, March 03, 2024, Shehbaz Sharif set to become Pakistan's Prime Minister for a second time - The Week;

Asif Basheer Chaudhry, Shehbaz Sharif returns as prime minister for the second time, *Th e-News*, March 3, 2024, Shehbaz Sharif returns as prime minister for the second time (thenews.com.pk); Shaiq Hussain and Rick Noack

Lawmakers pick Pakistan's leader, but Khan's shadow looms from prison, *The Washington Post*, March 3, 2024, Pakistan parliament elects Shehbaz Sharif as prime minister - *The Washington Post*

² (ANI) ANI): Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) has decided to hold a protest on March 2 against the alleged rigging in the elections held on February 8

https://www.bignewsnetwork.com/news/274140086/pakistan-tehreek-e-insaf-to-hold-nationwide-protests-against-rigging-in-polls-on-march-2#google_vignette

³ PTI holds countrywide protests poll rigging amid police crackdown, Pakistan Today, March 2, 2024, <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2024/03/02/pti-holds-countrywide-protests-against-poll-rigging-amid-police-crackdown/><https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2024/03/02/pti-holds-countrywide-protests-against-poll-rigging-amid-police-crackdown/>

⁴ PTI workers face legal action over protests, ET, March 12, 2024

<https://tribune.com.pk/story/2459112/pti-workers-face-legal-action-over-protests>

⁵ New finance minister appointed, ET, Rana March 12, 2024

<https://tribune.com.pk/story/2459074/new-finance-minister-appointed>

⁶ CEO of Pakistan's largest bank picked to lead the country out of the economic crisis, Reuters, March 12, 2024, <https://www.dhakatribune.com/341596>

⁷ Ibid

⁸ See editorial "Increase in debt burden", Business Recorder, March 9, 2024

⁹ "Imran Khan calls on US to raise voice over transparency of polls in Pakistan", Times of India, February 16, 2024, February 16, 2024, <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/pakistan/imran-khan-calls-on-us-to-raise-voice-over-transparency-of-polls-in-pakistan/articleshow/107740116.cms> Imran Khan calls on US to raise voice over transparency of polls in Pakistan (msn.com); Zaman, What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan's Election?, VOA, February 15, 2024, What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan's Election? (voanews.com); Imran Khan calls on US to raise voice over the transparency of polls in Pakistan, Times of India, February 16, 2024

ANI / Updated: Feb 16, 2024,

<https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/pakistan/imran-khan-calls-on-us-to-raise-voice-over-transparency-of-polls-in-pakistan/articleshow/107740116.cms> Imran Khan calls on US to raise voice over transparency of polls in Pakistan (msn.com) Sarah Zaman, "What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan's Election?", VOA, February 15, 2024, What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan's Election? (voanews.com)

¹⁰ Sarah Zaman, "What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan's Election?", VOA, February 15, 2024, What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan's Election? (voanews.com)

¹¹ Ibid

¹² Ibid

¹³ Pakistan's caretaker government has denied these allegations. Pakistan politician says his win was 'rigged.'

BBC News, February 15, 2024

Pakistan politician says his win was 'rigged' (msn.com) What Are the Key Takeaways from Pakistan's Election? VOA, February 15, 2024, 8:15 PM

By Sarah Zaman, "What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan's Election? (voanews.com)

¹⁴ Sarah Zaman, “What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election?”, VOA, February 15, 2024, What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election? (voanews.com); George Paul, “Shifting sands in Pakistan's political landscape”, February 15, 2024, Shifting sands in Pakistan's political landscape - Pakistan - Dunya News

¹⁵ Ibid

¹⁶ Usman Khan, “Pakistan Election 2024: Voter turnout dips, but gender gap narrows”, Feb 14, 2024, Pakistan Election 2024: Voter turnout dips, but gender gap narrows (FAFN Report) (samaa. tv)

¹⁷ Ibid

¹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹ By Azaz Syed, Sophia Saifi, and Rhea Mogul, “Pakistan’s major parties formally announce ruling coalition that keeps Imran Khan shut out”, CNN, February 21, 2024, Pakistan

²⁰ Sadanand Dhume, “Pakistanis Vote for Imran Khan—and With Their Feet”, Wall Street Journal, February 14, 2024, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/pakistanis-vote-for-imran-khanand-with-their-feet-election-chaos-migration-5280a42b>

²¹ Sadanand Dhume, “Pakistanis Vote for Imran Khan—and With Their Feet”, The Wall Street Journal, February 15, 2024

²² Asif Shahzad, “Pakistan's majority parties struggle to form coalition government”, Reuters, February 19, 2024, https://news.yahoo.com/pakistans-majority-parties-struggle-form-081834185.html?fr=sycsrp_catchall

²³ “Pakistan sovereign dollar bonds slide in aftermath of contentious election”, Reuters, February 19, 2024, https://finance.yahoo.com/news/pakistan-sovereign-dollar-bonds-slide-075658583.html?fr=sycsrp_catchall

²⁴ Sadanand Dhume, “Pakistanis Vote for Imran Khan—and With Their Feet”, The Wall Street Journal, February 15, 2024

²⁵ Abid Hussain, ‘Mandate thieves’: New Pakistan government takes shape amid a slew of jabs, Aljazeera, February 14, 2024, <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/2/14/mandate-thieves-new-pakistan-government-takes-shape-amid-slew-of-jabs>

²⁶ Sean Seddon and Farhat Javed, “Pakistan election: PMLN and PPP reach agreement on coalition government”, BBC News, February 21, 2024, <https://news.yahoo.com/pakistan-election-pmln-ppp-reach-204640784.html>

²⁷ Pakistan blocks X for the sixth day as activists criticize the social media platform’s shutdown.

The Associated Press, February 22, 2024, 6:06 AM

<https://wtop.com/social-media/2024/02/pakistan-blocks-x-for-the-sixth-day-as-activists-criticize-the-social-media-platforms-shutdown/>

²⁸ Ibid

²⁹ Ibid

³⁰ Ibid

³¹ Zain Zaman JANJUA, “Pakistan parties reach a power-sharing agreement, Khan loyalists left out”, AFP, February 21, 2024, https://news.yahoo.com/pakistan-parties-reach-power-sharing-023149890.html?fr=sycsrp_catchall; Sean Seddon and Farhat Javed, “Pakistan election: PMLN and PPP reach agreement on coalition government”, BBC News, February 21, 2024, <https://news.yahoo.com/pakistan-election-pmln-ppp-reach-204640784.html>

³² “Freedom Network demands restoration of X, slams caretaker govt”, Express Tribune, February 21, 2024, <https://tribune.com.pk/live-blog/37>

³³ “Confusion reigns in Pakistan’s rigged election” The Economist, February 9, 2024, it was said that:
<https://www.economist.com/asia/2024/02/09/confusion-reigns-in-pakistans-rigged-election>

³⁴ “Pakistan is out of friends and out of money” Economist, February 14, 2024, Pakistan is out of friends and out of money (economist.com)Pakistan is out of friends and out of money (economist.com)

³⁵ Hannah Ellis-Petersen and Shah Meer Baloch

“Pakistan’s generals’ elections” Guardian Weekly, February 16, Pakistan’s generals’ elections: inside the 16 February Guardian Weekly | Pakistan | The Guardian

³⁶ Asif Shahzad, “Pakistan's majority parties struggle to form coalition government”, Reuters, February 19, 2024, https://news.yahoo.com/pakistans-majority-parties-struggle-form-081834185.html?fr=sycsrp_catchall

Sarah Zaman, “What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election?”, VOA, February 15, 2024, What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election? (voanews.com)

³⁷ Sarah Zaman, “What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election?”, VOA, February 15, 2024, What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election? (voanews.com)

³⁸ “Pakistan's caretaker government has denied these allegations. Pakistan politician says his win was 'rigged', BBC News, February 15, 2024

Pakistan politician says his win was 'rigged' (msn.com); Sarah Zaman, “What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election?”, VOA, February 15, 2024, By What Are the Key Takeaways From Pakistan’s Election? (voanews.com)

³⁹ Raza Rumi, “Elections 2024: Militabishment Should Accept Defeat”, The Friday Times, February 13, 2024<https://thefridaytimes.com/13-Feb-2024/elections-2024-militabishment-should-accept-defeat>.

⁴⁰ JI smells a rat in 2024 elections, Express Tribune, February 19, 2024, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2456865/ji-smells-a-rat-in-2024-elections>

⁴¹ Irfan Ghauri, “Call for accountability amidst chaos” Express Tribune, February 19, 2024, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2456916/call-for-accountability-amidst-chaos>

⁴² European Union Questions Credibility of General Elections in Pakistan, ProPK, February 10, 2024, <https://propakistani.pk/2024/02/10/european-union-questions-credibility-of-general-elections-in-pakistan/>

⁴³ Charlie Campbell, “Pakistan’s Military Used Every Trick to Sideline Imran Khan—and failed. Now What?” Times, February 9, 2024, Pakistan’s Military Couldn’t Keep Imran Khan Down. Now What? | TIME

⁴⁴ Astha Rajvanshi, “Pioneering Human Rights Lawyer Hina Jilani Warns of Pakistan’s Unstable Future”, Time, February 15, 2024 Hina Jilani on Pakistan's Unstable Future Following Election | TIME

⁴⁵ George Paul, “Shifting sands in Pakistan's political landscape, February 15, 2024, Shifting sands in Pakistan's political landscape - Pakistan - Dunya News

⁴⁶ Ali Raza & Bureau report & Mumtaz Alvi, “PTI names Omar Ayub for PM, Mian Aslam for Punjab CM”, The News, February 16, 2024, PTI names Omar Ayub for PM, Mian Aslam for Punjab CM (thenews.com.pk)

⁴⁷ Kasim Abbasi, “Imran keen to mend fences with the US:”, The News, February 16, 2024, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/1158135-news-analysis-imran-keen-to-mend-fences-with-us>

⁴⁸ “Pakistan's caretaker government has denied these allegations. Pakistan politician says his win was 'rigged', BBC News, February 15, 2024, Pakistan politician says his win was 'rigged' (msn.com)

⁴⁹ Dunya News, February 15, 2024

⁵⁰ Zahid Hussain, “Polls and their aftermath”, Dawn, February 14, 2024, Polls and their aftermath - Newspaper - DAWN.COM

⁵¹ By Husain Haqqani, “Moving forward after the election”, The News, February 15, 2024, Moving forward after the election (thenews.com. pk)

⁵² Abid Hussain, ‘Mandate thieves’: New Pakistan government takes shape amid slew of jobs.

Aljazeera, February 14, 2024

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/2/14/mandate-thieves-new-pakistan-government-takes-shape-amid-slew-of-jabs>

⁵³ Ibid

⁵⁴ Omar Waraich, “Angry Young Pakistanis Give Imran Khan a Future Shot at Power”, Foreign Policy, February 12, 2024, Pakistan's Shock Election Gives Jailed Khan Another Chance (foreignpolicy.com)

⁵⁵ Michael Kugelman, “How Imran Khan’s Party Stunned Pakistan” Foreign Policy, How Imran Khan’s Party Stunned Pakistan – Foreign Policy

⁵⁶ “Multiple parties protest against alleged result manipulation, election rigging”, The News, February 19, 2024, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/liveblog/pakistan-election-2024-live-updates>,

⁵⁷ “Pakistan's Imran Khan-backed candidates to join Sunni party -interim party chief”, Reuters, February 19, 2024, <https://news.yahoo.com/pakistans-imran-khan-backed-candidates-121122177.html>

⁵⁸ Zahid Hussain, “Hybrid rule 3.0” Dawn, February 21, 2024, Hybrid rule 3.0? - Newspaper - DAWN.COM

⁵⁹ Arifa Noor, “A giant’s strength”, published in Dawn on February 20, 2024, A giant’s strength - Newspaper - DAWN.COM

⁶⁰ “PPP, PML-N forming govt at Centre, announces Bilawal”, Express Tribune, February 21, LIVE Blog: PPP, PML-N break impasse on government formation | The Express Tribune;

“Pakistan's largest parties strike a deal on coalition government”, Reuters, February 21, 2024, <https://news.yahoo.com/pakistans-largest-parties-strike-deal-190321107.html>

⁶¹ Asif Shahzad and Ariba Shahid, “Pakistan in for 'roller coaster' ride after parties strike deal”, Reuters, February 21, 2024, https://news.yahoo.com/pakistan-roller-coaster-ride-parties-145724518.html?fr=sycsrp_catchall

⁶² Ibid

⁶³ “An Election Shatters the Image of Pakistan’s Mightiest Force” New York Times, February 21, 2024, <https://www.nytimes.com/2024/02/21/world/asia/pakistan-military-election.html>

⁶⁴ Ibid

⁶⁵ <https://www.thenews.com.pk/liveblog/pakistan-election-2024-live-updatesAfter>

⁶⁶ “PPP, PML-N woos other coalition partners for govt formation”, The Tribune, February 21, 2024, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2457181/after-ppp-pml-n-woos-other-coalition-partners-for-govt-formation>

⁶⁷ “SHC orders restoration of social media apps including X”, Express Tribune, February 21, 2024, <https://tribune.com.pk/live-blog/37>

⁶⁸ AFP in its report “Shehbaz Sharif: Pakistan's compromise candidate prime”, minister”, published on March 3, 2024, maintained that: <https://news.yahoo.com/shehbaz-sharif-pakistans-compromise-candidate-075817083.html>

⁶⁹ “Pakistan's 'King of Chaos' Imran Khan keeps winning even behind bars”, BBC, March 3, 2024, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-68422821>

⁷⁰ “Lawmakers pick Pakistan’s leader, but Khan’s shadow looms from prison, The Washington Post”, March 3, 2024, Pakistan parliament elects Shehbaz Sharif as prime minister - The Washington Post

⁷¹ Vivek Katju in his article “Pakistan: With Shehbaz Sharif set to become PM, army will use every means to weaken Imran Khan”, Pakistan: With Shehbaz Sharif set to become PM, the army will use every means to weaken Imran Khan – Firstpost

⁷² Reuters, in its report “Pakistan’s Shehbaz Sharif to take oath as prime minister for a second term today” [published on Pakistan’s Shehbaz Sharif to take oath as prime minister for a second term today | Pakistan News - The Indian Express

⁷³ See editorial entitled “democracy damaged” published in Dawn February 28, 2024, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1817721>

⁷⁴ JUI-F reject February 8 polls, demand fresh elections.

ANI, February 28 (ANI): <https://www.bignewsnetwork.com/news/274140316/pakistan-gda-ji-and-jui-f-reject-february-8-polls-demand-fresh-elections>

⁷⁵ Abid Hussain, “a Pakistani journalist was arrested for social posts against government officials”, Aljazeera, February 27, 2024, <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/2/27/pakistani-journalist-arrested-for-social-posts-against-government-officials>

⁷⁶ Ibid

⁷⁷ “The New PTI Government’s Agenda for Modernization of Public Services”, International Affairs Forum, Center for International Relations, August 31, 2018, http://www.ia-forum.org/Content/ViewInternal_Document.cfm?contenttype_id=1&ContentID=8858

⁷⁸ Nasir Iqbal, “The importance of human capital”, The News, October 29, 2018

<https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/386772-the-importance-of-human-capital>

⁷⁹ Ibid

⁸⁰ Nasir Iqbal, “The importance of human capital”, The News, October 29, 2018

<https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/386772-the-importance-of-human-capital>

⁸¹ Ibid

⁸² Ibid

⁸³ Ibid

⁸⁴ “The New PTI Government’s Agenda for Modernization of Public Services”, International Affairs Forum, Center for International Relations, August 31, 2018, http://www.ia-forum.org/Content/ViewInternal_Document.cfm?contenttype_id=1&ContentID=8858

⁸⁵ Iftikhar A. Khan, “South Punjab bill may be on NA’s agenda for Monday”, Dawn, March 26, 2022

⁸⁶ World Bank Urges Pakistan to Simplify its Tax Regime and Increase Revenue Potential, pro-Pakistani.pk, Apr 17, 2023, World Bank Urges Pakistan to Simplify its Tax Regime and Increase Revenue Potential (pro-Pakistani. pk)

⁸⁷ Ibid

⁸⁸ Ibid

⁸⁹ Ibid

⁹⁰ Ibid

91 “The New PTI Government’s Agenda for Modernization of Public Services”, International Affairs Forum, Center for International Relations, August 31, 2018, http://www.ia-forum.org/Content/ViewInternal_Document.cfm?contenttype_id=1&ContentID=8858

92 Iftikhar A. Khan, “South Punjab bill may be on NA’s agenda for Monday”, Dawn, March 26, 2022

93 Ansar Abbasi, “, Failure to implement approved reforms frustrated Ishrat Hussain, The News, July 31, 2021

<https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/871234-failure-to-implement-approved-reforms-frustrated-ishrat-hussain>, accessed July 31, 2021, and Shahzad Paracha, PM’s aide Dr Ishrat Hussain calls it a day, Pakistan Today, July 30, 2021,

<https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2021/07/30/pms-aide-dr-ishrat-hussain-calls-it-a-day/>, accessed July 30, 2021

94 Javed Younas, “Breaking the status quo”, Dawn, April 22, 2023, Breaking the status quo - Newspaper - DAWN.COM

95 PM asks his team to set high performance benchmark for next 2 years, Daily Times, September 22, 2021, <https://dailytimes.com.pk/819725/pm-asks-his-team-to-set-high-performance-benchmark-for-next-2-years/>, accessed September 22, 2021

96 Ibid

97 Ibid

98 Ibid

99 Ibid

100 Ansar Abbasi, “Failure to implement approved reforms frustrated Ishrat Hussain”, The News, July 31, 2021, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/871234-failure-to-implement-approved-reforms-frustrated-ishrat-hussain>, accessed July 31, 2021

101

Reforms underway to improve tax system: PM Imran, ET, July 30, 2021 <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2313008/reforms-underway-to-improve-tax-system-pm-imran>, accessed July 30, 2021

102 NAB recovers Rs 484 billion in three years of PTI government, Times of Islamabad, May 24, 2021, <https://timesofislamabad.com/24-May-2021/nab-recovers-rs-484-billion-in-three-years-of-pti-government>, accessed May 24, 2021

103 Shehryar Warraich, “Divided on accountability, The News on Sunday,

October 21, 2018, <http://tns.thenews.com.pk/divided-accountability/>, accessed October 27, 2018